

Creative Scotland

# CashBack for Creativity

Phase 4

Year 3 and Summative Evaluation Report

July 2020

—  
**BOP**  
Consulting



# Credits

## **Written and prepared by**

Joshua Dedman, Douglas Lonie and Barbara McKissack, BOP Consulting

## **Image credit**

Citymoves Dance Agency

---

**BOP**  
Consulting

# Contents

<b>Executive Summary</b> .....	<b>2</b>
<b>1. Background</b> .....	<b>6</b>
1.1 CashBack for Creativity .....	6
1.2 Evaluation approach and CashBack for Creativity .....	6
1.3 Interpretation of evaluation findings.....	7
1.4 Profile of programme participants.....	7
<b>2. Impact on organisations</b> .....	<b>10</b>
<b>3. Impact on communities</b> .....	<b>12</b>
<b>4. Building capacity and confidence</b> .....	<b>14</b>
<b>Case study 1: PILOT, Firefly Arts</b> .....	<b>17</b>
<b>5. Developing physical and personal skills</b> .....	<b>19</b>
<b>Case study 2: Stretch, Hot Chocolate</b> .....	<b>21</b>
<b>6. Having a positive change on behaviour and aspiration</b> .....	<b>23</b>
<b>Case Study 3: Macrobert-In, Macrobert Arts Centre</b> .....	<b>26</b>
<b>7. Improving wellbeing</b> .....	<b>28</b>
<b>8. Improving learning, employability and employment options (positive destinations) [Targeted Fund only]</b> .....	<b>31</b>
<b>9. Participating in positive activity</b> .....	<b>35</b>
<b>10. Key project learning</b> .....	<b>37</b>
<b>Appendices</b> .....	<b>39</b>

## List of Figures

Figure 1 Total programme participant numbers – Year 3.....	7
Figure 2 Total programme participant numbers – All years .....	8

Figure 3 Gender breakdown – Year 3.....	8
Figure 4 Gender breakdown – All years.....	8
Figure 5 SIMD breakdown (cumulative proportions) – Year 3.....	9
Figure 6 SIMD breakdown (cumulative proportions) – All years.....	9
Figure 7 Progress towards targets in building capacity and confidence - based on grant offer letter – Year 3 .....	15
Figure 8 Progress towards targets in building capacity and confidence - based on grant offer letter – All years .....	16
Figure 9 Progress towards targets in developing physical and personal skills – based on grant offer letter – Year 3 .....	20
Figure 10 Progress towards targets in developing physical and personal skills – based on grant offer letter – All years .....	20
Figure 11 Progress towards targets having positive change on behaviour and aspiration – based on grant offer letter – Year 3.....	24
Figure 12 Progress towards targets having positive change on behaviour and aspiration – based on grant offer letter – All years .....	25
Figure 13 Progress towards targets in improving participants’ wellbeing – based on grant offer letter – Year 3 .....	29
Figure 14 Progress towards targets in improving participants’ wellbeing – based on grant offer letter – All years .....	30
Figure 15 Where Targeted Fund participants have progressed to after completion of the programme (positive destinations) - Year 3.....	33
Figure 16 Where Targeted Fund participants have progressed to after completion of the programme (positive destinations) – All years.....	34
Figure 17 Progress towards targets in participants participating in positive activity – based on grant offer letter – Year 3 .....	36
Figure 18 Progress towards targets in participants participating in positive activity – based on grant offer letter – All years .....	36
Figure 19 CashBack for Creativity Open Fund Year 3 organisations - spend by organisation.....	39

Figure 20 CashBack for Creativity Open Fund Year 3 organisations – spend by Local Authority ..... 41

Figure 21 CashBack for Creativity Targeted Fund organisations – Year 3 and project spend by organisation..... 42

Figure 22 CashBack for Creativity Targeted Fund organisations – spend by Local Authority (Year 3)..... 43

Figure 23 CashBack for Creativity Targeted Fund organisations – spend by Local Authority (All years) ..... 44

# Executive Summary

CashBack for Creativity offers young people across Scotland the opportunity to engage in creative and cultural activity. Funded by the Scottish Government's CashBack for Communities programme, it provides high quality learning and developmental activities across all art forms.

## Year 3 overview

In Year 3 of CashBack for Creativity Phase 4, a total of 5,389 young people participated in the activities of 60 projects.

This included 2,282 young people across the 15 projects within the Targeted Fund, and 3,107 young people across the 45 projects of the Open Fund.

CashBack for Creativity is reaching those living in some of Scotland's poorest areas:

76.6% of participants came from or took part in the 0-20% most deprived areas of Scotland, and just 13.5% from within the 50-100% least deprived areas of Scotland.

High numbers of participants were recorded as achieving positive outcomes as a result of taking part, including:

- 4,512 Young people reported their confidence increased
- 4,551 Young people reported they are able to do new things, as a result of the programme
- 3,660 Young people reported their (creative and technical) skills were increased
- 1,505 Young people gained accreditations (e.g. Arts Award)
- 3,769 Young people reported a positive impact on their wellbeing.

The outcomes that scored particularly highly against what was expected in Year 3 were those related to taking part in accreditations or progressing to positive destinations. These included:

- Young people progressing into further opportunities, especially progressing into a further informal learning opportunity in another organisation, or remaining at / returning to school
- Young people gaining accreditation for learning and skills development. The target was surpassed in Year 3. Arts Award and Dynamic Youth Awards were particularly popular
- Young people feeling able to do new things following their engagement
- Stakeholders reporting an increase in young people's confidence and capacity.

These numbers indicate strong relationships between the funded organisations and local schools and colleges, as well as having an impact on a wide range of personal outcomes.

The outcome areas that scored lower than expected include:

- Young people reporting their skills increased
- Young people reporting an increase in their aspirations
- Young people reporting a positive change in their behaviour.

## All years overview

Across the three years of CashBack for Creativity Phase 4, a total of 14,287 young people participated in the activities of 127 projects.

This included 6,754 young people across the 16 projects within the Targeted Fund, and 7,533 young people across the 111 projects of the Open Fund.

As with interim years, the CashBack for Creativity programme reached those living in some of Scotland's poorest areas:

61.5% of participants came from or took part in the 0-20% most deprived areas of Scotland, and just 17.2% from within the 50-100% least deprived areas of Scotland.

High numbers of participants were recorded as achieving positive outcomes as a result of taking part, including:

- 10,862 Young people reported their confidence increased
- 10,696 Young people reported they are able to do new things, as a result of the programme
- 9,403 Young people reported their (creative and technical) skills were increased
- 3,155 Young people gained accreditations (e.g. Arts Award)
- 9,435 Young people reported a positive impact on their wellbeing

The outcomes that scored particularly highly against what was expected over the three years were those related to taking part in accreditations or progressing to positive destinations. These included:

- Young people progressing into further opportunities, especially progressing into a further informal learning opportunity in the host organisation or in another organisation, and remaining at or returning to school
- Young people gaining accreditation for learning and skills development. individuals.

As with year three findings, these numbers indicate strong relationships between the funded organisations and local partners.

The outcome areas that scored lower than expected include:

- Young people report their confidence increasing
- Young people report increases in wellbeing against SHANARRI indicators
- Young people report increased aspirations
- Young people report positive changes in their behaviour.

## Summary of key programme learning

### On maximising the positive impact on organisations:

- Ensure programmes can be built-in to the overall organisational offer, and that staff and participants can be supported across projects from different funders wherever possible
- Funders should consider making some 'draw-down' funds available for when projects have the possibility to grow or positively adapt from agreed applications
- Projects should ensure they have staff capacity to support on participant accreditation, as well as clear strategies for enabling participants to progress through accreditation wherever possible.

### On maximising the impact on communities:

- Encourage projects to consider devising a 'community impact' plan, which will outline which ways they will intend to have a positive affect locally, including any additional partnerships needed
- Consider how funded projects can be made aware of other funded activity in their locality so that community resources and onward referral can be maximised.

### To build young people's capacity and confidence

- Recognise that there is a logical sequence for 'additional' outcomes to be achieved; that confidence to participate in something new is often the first step for certain young people, and that further progress takes time and resources, particularly for the most vulnerable young people
- Encourage a balance between retention of existing participants between quarters and years of delivery and engaging new participants in activities. This should also be flexible to community needs and project developments wherever possible.



#### To develop young people's physical and personal skills:

- Consider asking organisations to scope in detail how they will resource accreditations throughout projects and signpost to any additional support available
- Enable a flexible evaluation approach to be adopted by projects to better demonstrate skills development where accreditations are not deemed appropriate.

#### To have a positive change on young people's behaviour and aspiration:

- Not all young people need to change their behaviour. Outcomes such as this should be critically, rather than universally applied, and a more inclusive approach taken to such 'deficit'-focused outcomes
- Projects that were more successful in improving aspiration often worked with artists and cultural professionals as guest tutors or guest speakers to share what life is like in the sector. Working with professionals in parallel sectors (e.g. education, community development) can also demonstrate to participants how they can aspire to previously unconsidered careers.

#### To improve young people's wellbeing

- Bespoke training or support should be provided to organisations expected to report against SHANARRI indicators. It should also be clarified whether an outcome being met is recorded against progress in one, a selection, or all indicators and over which timeframes (i.e. one session, one 'term', or longer)
- Projects found it easier to report wellbeing outcomes in relation to more physical activities (e.g. dance, movement, performance), further work should be done with projects to explore how environmental and psycho-social creative processes are linked to SHANARRI outcomes. There is a strong body of evidence linking creative practice with wellbeing, but many projects find it difficult to demonstrate these effects within the resources available.

#### To improve young people's learning, employability and employment options

- The definition of 'positive destinations' is relatively broad and should be agreed with projects on a case-by-case basis. For young people who are

excluded from school a positive destination is a reorientation to education (recognising the likely complex structural barriers to actual re-entry into education), for those who need support to apply to college or an apprenticeship another set of activities and support is required. For some participants the opportunity to stay and progress within a project is the most positive destination (or 'location'). These will be largely context and cohort dependent, with flexibility of definition necessary

- Well-established and mutual partnerships are often key to enabling 'positive destinations' external to project activity. It should be acknowledged in funding design and project planning that building and maintaining a range of appropriate partnerships will require time and resources.

#### For engaging young people in positive activity

- Programme success will depend on getting people through the door and keeping them participating. It is important to offer a range of accessible activities, coupled with an offer of progression opportunities for those showing an interest. This will likely need to be adapted for different groups (e.g. age groups, level of experience, additional challenges faced) and requires flexible support from funders as a result.

#### For future evaluation

- Many organisations in Phase 4 found the number of outcomes they were expected to report against difficult to manage, both in terms of programme design and monitoring and evaluation. An opportunity to select fewer, more specific and bespoke, outcomes against overarching programme impacts (set more generically) would be welcomed
- This could be complemented with more resource for evaluation support at the project level and budget setting in general (e.g. recommending funding for staff training and development in M&E pre-delivery)
- More flexibility in participant number targets would also be welcomed. Some projects reported that they recruited fewer participants because there was a greater appetite (and opportunity) for progression for existing participants. Others considered it a strong impact if they were able to unexpectedly attract

a large number of young people to a new activity. Reconsidering how impact is defined (i.e. towards meaningful change and away from participant numbers) would also encourage a stronger culture of evaluation at all levels. Enabling projects to set 'ceiling/floor margins' for expected participant numbers could be considered

- Targeted Fund projects reported positive operational impacts from being brought together with others doing similar work for mutual learning, particularly when this could involve both management and delivery staff. Understanding the mechanisms that lead to positive project impact in this way could be advanced using a 'community of practice' approach among organisations with similar professional interests (e.g. across sectors within localities, or across localities within sectors)
- A tension was identified between generating positive news stories for promoting the 'CashBack for Creativity' brand and ability to report critical learning or negative impact. This should also be considered in programme marketing, communications and advocacy plans and expectations, and kept separate wherever possible.



# 1. Background

## 1.1 CashBack for Creativity

CashBack for Creativity Phase 4 ran from mid-2017 to March 2020. It offered young people, aged 10 - 24 years, across Scotland the opportunity to engage in creative and cultural activity. Funded by the Scottish Government's CashBack for Communities programme, it provided high quality learning and developmental activities across all art forms.

The key focus areas for the programme included improving the skills and confidence of young people, raising attainment and aspirations, and providing pathways for further learning, training, education and employment.

The programme operated across two funds:

- **The CashBack for Creativity Open Fund (£750k over three years)** – to create opportunities for a range of organisations, working in collaboration with artists and practitioners across the country. Applicants could apply for funding of up to £10k to deliver high quality arts activities for up to 12 months. This fund was administered by Youthlink Scotland. In Year 3, a total of 45 organisations were provided funding (full breakdown in Appendix)
- **The CashBack for Creativity Targeted Fund (£1.5m over three years)** - a programme of engagement, learning, development and progression activities for targeted young people. In Year 3, the Fund was delivered through 15 organisations across a broad portfolio of projects and programmes. These organisations could apply for up to £120k over three years from 2017 to 2020 (full breakdown in Appendix).

## 1.2 Evaluation approach and CashBack for Creativity

In June 2017, BOP Consulting was commissioned by Creative Scotland to evaluate Phase 4 of the CashBack for Creativity programme. Extending over both the Open Fund and the Targeted Fund, the Year Three evaluation built from the methodological approach from Year One and Year Two. This included:

- Evaluation dissemination and data gathering at a learning event in September 2019 in Edinburgh
- In-depth 'case study' visits to three organisations in Year 3 (Firefly, YTAS and Macrobert Arts Centre)
- Review of all submitted end of year/end of project report forms and supporting evidence (Open and Targeted Funds).

The overall CashBack for Communities programme outcomes framework outlines several outcomes for projects to work towards (set by the Scottish Government). Those selected as most relevant for, and therefore guiding the intended impact for the projects funded in CashBack for Creativity are:

- Building capacity and confidence
- Developing physical and personal skills
- Having a positive change on behaviour and aspiration
- Improving wellbeing
- Improving learning, employability and employment options (positive destinations) (Targeted Fund only)
- Participating in positive activity
- Contributing positively to their communities (Open Fund only)

By considering each outcome area in turn, as well as the overall impact of the programme on the organisations themselves and the communities they operated in, this combined Year 3 and Summative report looks to both critically

review progress, but also understand lessons learnt, as well as organisational and civic impacts.

### 1.3 Interpretation of evaluation findings

Throughout this report we have provided the total number of participants reported by projects as achieving a particular outcome. The methods for assessing whether a participant has achieved an outcome vary from project to project (i.e. in some projects questionnaires are used, whilst in others progress is based on interviews with practitioners). There are significant differences in the numbers of participants taking part in different projects, with some seeking to achieve bigger impacts with smaller numbers, and others seeking to achieve more modest impacts with a larger cohort. The quantitative record of the number of individuals achieving different outcomes should therefore be considered alongside the qualitative accounts provided by projects that demonstrate how outcomes overlap and how participants experience progression journeys differently.

Another lesson from Phase 4 is that organisations across both funds have likely been underreporting outcomes due to the additional resources required for evaluation methods to be applied consistently and at scale. This lack of confidence in evaluation at the project level also means that some positive outcomes that are being achieved within projects are likely being underreported. Cashback for Communities/Scottish Government and Creative Scotland may wish to consider how evaluation capacity can be increased across projects in future programmes (i.e. support to design and apply their own methods, analyse data and report findings).

### 1.4 Profile of programme participants

The CashBack for Creativity programme is focused on young people between the ages of 10 and 24 years across Scotland. It was particularly targeted at those living in areas experiencing acute deprivation (i.e. on the ‘higher’ end of the Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation (SIMD)), as well as those excluded or

at risk of exclusion from school, not in education, employment or training, or those engaging in offending or anti-social behaviour (or at risk of doing so).

#### Participation numbers

Across the two funds, in Year 3, a total of 5,389 young people participated in the activities of the 60 projects (Figure 1). This included 2,282 young people across the 15 projects within the Targeted Fund, and 3,107 young people across the 45 projects of the Open Fund.

**Figure 1 Total programme participant numbers – Year 3**

	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Variance
Targeted	2,733	2,282	-451
Open	3,334	3,107	-227
<b>Total</b>	<b>6,067</b>	<b>5,389</b>	<b>-678</b>

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

Across the two funds and across all years, a total of 14,287 young people participated in the activities of the 127 projects (Figure 2). This included 6,754 young people across the 161 projects within the Targeted Fund, and 7,533 young people across the 111 projects of the Open Fund.

<sup>1</sup> Dancebase took part in Year 1 and 2. YsortIt took part in Year 3 only

**Figure 2 Total programme participant numbers – All years**

	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Variance
Targeted	8,000	6,754	-1,246
Open	10,000	7,533	-2,467
<b>Total</b>	<b>18,000</b>	<b>14,287</b>	<b>-3,713</b>

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

### Gender of participants

Across the two funds, in Year 3, there was a slight female bias in participation (52.1%) (Figure 3). 5% of participants preferred not to disclose their gender.

**Figure 3 Gender breakdown – Year 3**

Gender	Targeted Fund	%	Open Fund	%	Programme Total	%
Male	899	39.9%	1,434	46.2%	2,333	43.5%
Female	1,190	52.8%	1,601	51.6%	2,791	52.1%
Prefer not to say	193	8.6%	72	2.3%	265	5.0%
<b>Total</b>	<b>2,282</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>3,107</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>5,389</b>	<b>100%</b>

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

Across the two funds and across all years, there was a slight female bias in participation (56.2%) (Figure 4). 2.4% of participants preferred not to disclose their gender.

**Figure 4 Gender breakdown – All years**

Gender	Targeted Fund	%	Open Fund	%	Programme Total	%
Male	2,723	40.3%	3,169	42%	5,892	41.2%
Female	3,744	55.4%	4,292	57%	8,036	56.2%
Prefer not to say	264	3.9%	72	1.0%	336	2.4%
Happy to say	17	0.3%	0	0%	17	0.1%
<b>Total</b>	<b>6,754</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>7,533</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>14,287</b>	<b>100.0%</b>

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

### Affluence of participants

Across the Year 3 Targeted Fund projects, of the 1,723 participants who provided their postcode and therefore were able to calculate their SIMD ranking, 55.7% of participants lived within the 0-20% most deprived areas of Scotland. The vast majority (88.3%) of the Year 3 Open Fund projects were delivered within the 0-20% SIMD range<sup>2</sup>. Across the programme, this averaged at 76.6% of participants coming from or taking part in the 0-20% most deprived areas of Scotland, and just 13.5% from within the 50-100% least deprived areas of Scotland (Figure 5).

<sup>2</sup> NB: In order to be proportionate in reporting and data management, the Targeted Fund SIMD data is based on participant postcode, and the Open Fund is based on the location of where the activity was provided.

**Figure 5 SIMD breakdown (cumulative proportions) – Year 3**

SIMD breakdown	Targeted Fund Participants	%	Open Fund Participants	%	Programme Total	%
0-20%	960	55.7%	2,742	88.3%	3,702	76.6%
0-30%	1,048	60.8%	2,845	91.6%	3,893	80.6%
0-40%	1,167	67.7%	2,908	93.6%	4,075	84.4%
0-50%	1,269	73.7%	2,908	93.6%	4,177	86.5%
50-100%	454	26.3%	199	6.4%	653	13.5%
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,723</b>	<b>100.0%</b>	<b>3,107</b>	<b>100.0%</b>	<b>4,830</b>	<b>100.0%</b>

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

**Figure 6 SIMD breakdown (cumulative proportions) – All years**

SIMD breakdown	Targeted Fund Participants	%	Open Fund Participants	%	Programme Total	%
0-20%	3,112	53.0%	2,416	77.8%	5,528	61.5%
0-30%	3,606	61.4%	2,742	88.3%	6,348	70.7%
0-40%	4,108	69.9%	2,845	91.6%	6,953	77.4%
0-50%	4,528	77.1%	2,908	93.6%	7,436	82.8%
50-100%	1,347	22.9%	199	6.4%	1,546	17.2%
<b>Total</b>	<b>5,875</b>	<b>100.0%</b>	<b>3,107</b>	<b>100.0%</b>	<b>8,982</b>	<b>100.0%</b>

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

Across the Targeted Fund projects and across all years, of the 5,875 participants who provided their postcode and therefore were able to calculate their SIMD ranking, 53.0% of participants lived within the 0-20% most deprived areas of Scotland. Just over three-quarters (77.8%) of the Open Fund projects (all years) were delivered within the 0-20% SIMD range<sup>3</sup>. Across the programme, this averaged at 61.5% of participants coming from or taking part in the 0-20% most deprived areas of Scotland, compared to 17.2% from within the 50-100% least deprived areas of Scotland (Figure 6).

<sup>3</sup> NB: In order to be proportionate in reporting and data management, the Targeted Fund SIMD data is based on participant postcode, and the Open Fund is based on the location of where the activity was provided.

## 2. Impact on organisations

The CashBack for Creativity programme impacted, directly and indirectly, on the organisations taking part. Impacts ranged from strategic and organisational changes (e.g. new roles created, adapted delivery and ways of working, and new partnership working), to institutional learning, upskilling of staff, enhanced organisational reputation, amongst others. This section outlines the most significant of these.

### Key findings for Year 3

#### Targeted fund

- By working with partners and greater participant numbers, 12 of the 15 Targeted Fund organisations reported having greater and more positive exposure, both within their sector (i.e. other cultural organisations), but also in aligned sectors (e.g. policy, health, education). Hot Chocolate reported that their profile through the project has strengthened their links and opportunities with Creative Scotland, which has in turn enabled new partnership links with the British Council
- Additional funding enabled organisations to build capacity and create new roles and responsibilities. This enabled them to test new ways of working and models of support (e.g. one to ones, showcases, podcast creation), some of which have remained beyond the programme (e.g. Eden Court)
- The monitoring and evaluation (M&E) itself provided valuable skills and learning across the organisations. Organisations that regularly reviewed and shared progress (e.g. MCR Pathways) found the process invaluable for developing an 'evidence-led decision-making culture' going forward
- There were two overarching challenges underlying these organisational impacts. First, ensuring partnerships remain positive and communicative throughout the process, rather than on similar but different paths. It's important to have a joined up shared approach, where all partners can learn and maximise their capacity for support. Second, ensuring there is institutional learning from the process, with reflection and training days for

staff. Often important nuance and lessons are lost if all energy is expended on delivery and structured reflection is not built in

- There were two overarching mechanisms that successful projects shared in maximising organisational value. First, they commonly instilled effective communication of impact, internally and externally to unlock further opportunities. Second, they continually made the case for the evaluation, as part of delivery, rather than an add-on. This helped create a reflective and iterative process of delivery improvement, as well as having insightful data for where impacts are being made.

“ There is no doubt from us or our partners that the CashBack for Creativity fund has allowed us to work on multiple long-term projects that have been of great benefit and allowed us to try varied models of participation and delivery.

- Eden Court

#### Open Fund

- Despite only being funded for one-year, Open Fund organisations were able to build their capacity and profile, typically through new and stronger partnerships. Lyth Arts Centre, for the first time in their 40-year history, were able to offer a dedicated young people's programme. This enabled them to really focus on working with other specialist socially focused organisations in the community in effective, joined up targeted support. Some of these partnerships have continued beyond the funding period
- Organisations learned the importance of making learning applicable to real life situations, rather than speaking in general or abstract ways. M-Tech Paisley found this grounded vocabulary and curriculum helped engage young people on a relatable level. From this peer-focused approach, it was considered easier to build participants' 'soft skills' (e.g. confidence, communication), which in turn aids the transition from an idea in their mind to 'something tangible and achievable'

- The programme provided valuable insights into the specific skill-sets tutors need in order to provide high quality support. The D&G Innovation Project specifically highlighted the wealth of technical skills, but also strong interpersonal skills (e.g. communication, teamwork, active listening) required to be responsive and engaging with young people from a wide range of backgrounds
- Some organisations were able to test a ‘co-design’ approach for the first time, consulting participants directly in what type of support would work best for them. Both Lyth Arts Centre Young Company and Listen Lanarkshire evolved their practices to be more consultative, which was found to empower the participants and produce an improved offer.

“ For the first time we used a co-design process which allowed us to empower the participants and produce a flexible and responsive project.

- Lyth Arts Centre Young Company

### Key findings for Targeted Fund across all years

End of Project reports outlined many of the same key organisational impacts and learning highlighted in Year 3 annual reports. In addition, Targeted Fund organisations reported:

- Stronger links and strategic thinking internally by the end of the three years. This was achieved through more formalised and regular internal communications, as well as bringing together various programme strands and tutors, who typically would have worked separately
- Unlocking future funding for after the programme. Being able to communicate their impact effectively, as well as demonstrating the adoption of key lessons from Phase 4, Eden Court and YDance were successful in their funding application for Cashback for Communities Phase 5.

- Development of new services for young people which will be sustained beyond the life of this project (e.g. Findhorn Bay Arts have since applied to the Youth Music Initiative fund for a year-long youth music project)
- Organisations learnt the need to have reserves and contingency funds. It was not uncommon for organisations paying for additional training and other unforeseen costs from their own budgets, as projects changed during the course of the programme. Such flexible ‘draw-down’ funds would be welcomed in any future similar programmes
- There were two overarching challenges underlying these impacts. As with Year 3, organisations recognised the challenge of ensuring partnerships remain positive and communicative throughout the process, as well as enabling institutional learning from the process, with reflection and training days for staff. A further challenge mentioned in End of Project reports was having the right people and capacity to deliver accreditations as planned. This was particularly the case for delivering Arts Award, which multiple organisations struggled with delivering given the required time and resource by both tutors and participants.

### Key programme learning

- Ensure programmes can be built-in to the overall organisational offer, and that staff and participants can support across projects from different funders wherever possible
- Funders should consider making some ‘draw-down’ funds available for when projects have the possibility to grow or positively adapt from agreed applications
- Projects should ensure they have staff capacity to support on participant accreditation, as well as clear strategies for enabling participants to progress through accreditation wherever possible.



### 3. Impact on communities

The CashBack for Creativity programme had a range of immediate and long-term civic impacts. These were directly related to programme delivery (e.g. new community partnerships coming together for the first time and participants becoming active members within their local communities), as well as an indirect consequence of the programme taking place (e.g. project volunteers gaining valued skills and knowledge, which they are now using in other community activities). This section outlines the most significant of these.

#### Key findings for Year 3

##### Targeted fund

- Following their engagement with the programme, participants have become (more) active members of their local community. This was largely down to two interrelated efforts by the Targeted Fund organisations. First, effective signposting and referrals to complementary follow up destinations and opportunities (further details in Section 8). Second, empowering participants to believe and know they can make a difference in their community if they would 'give it a go'
- As part of the programme delivery, the projects supported their community partners to grow their own capacity and reach. Linked to the previous point, this was through both providing a 'pipeline' of young people to engage with, as well as raising awareness of the partners' programmes and offer
- There are specific examples of projects enhancing their community's cultural infrastructure for other young people to access. For example, Quarrier's Carlton Studio has continued to offer the community's young people a free space to record and mix music recordings, as well as rehearse
- Project volunteers have gained valuable hard and soft skills. Organisations report that their volunteers have continued to apply to other community activities they are involved in (e.g. Findhorn Bay Arts).

##### Open Fund

- Several Open Fund organisations reported participants and stakeholders increased awareness of the importance and existence of the art and cultural offer within their local community, as a result of the programme. For example, Listen Lanarkshire radio broadcasted topics focused on the talents of local young people, as well as sharing current affairs. This highlighted a latent talent amongst residents, as well as the opportunity for listeners to know what's happening locally and take part
- In some specific cases the programme enhanced the local community's built environment. For example, RIG Arts created a 9-foot structure in the centre of Clydebank Shopping Centre. This was received very positively, acting as a piece of public art for visitors to enjoy, as well as bringing new attention to the school partner and the programme
- Project volunteers gained valued skills and knowledge they can and have since used in other community activities. This was specifically the case for TD1 Music Project, whose programme staff are largely freelance artists and creative practitioners
- Several organisations spoke of how they developed new partnerships with other youth services in their local town. In the case of Lyth Arts Centre Young Company, it has increased capacity for these services to create a professional, high quality arts experience offer for the young people they work with, which was previously not happening.

#### Key findings for Targeted Fund across all years

End of Project reports outlined many of the same key civic impacts highlighted in Year 3 annual reports. In addition, Targeted Fund organisations reported:

- A 'spill over effect', where the projects' activity within in their communities attracted additional footfall and attention for other community initiatives. For example, YTAS delivery partner, Toonspeak, shared their outreach plan with their landlords. Collectively they successfully increased footfall into Glasgow city centre, having a positive knock on effect in exposing other community programmes taking place

- A 'cascade effect', where initial engagements led to follow-up opportunities elsewhere. For example, YDance worked successfully in tandem with their local authority, where participants graduated onto programmes run by the council's Dance Hubs
- YTAS spoke of how the project led to better connected initiatives within local youth work. This has led directly to new referrals, partnerships for new funding, as well as the more use of local community venues by young people
- There were two overarching mechanisms that successful projects shared in maximising civic value. First, they focused explicitly in strengthening the voice of local young people and giving them a place within the local creative community. Advocacy work and campaigns were effective in this effort. Second, they provided varied and flexible activity, enabling young people with other personal and familial commitments to dip in and out as needed.

### **Key programme learning**

- Encourage projects to consider devising a 'community impact' plan, which will outline which ways they will intend to have a positive effect locally, including any additional partnerships needed
- Consider how funded projects can be made aware of other funded activity in their locality so that community resources and onward referral can be maximised.

## 4. Building capacity and confidence

One of the core outcomes that projects were seeking to achieve for participants is an increase in their self-confidence and awareness of further opportunities. Capacity and confidence in this sense can include the confidence to take part in the first place, as well as the capacity developed through acquiring new skills and trying new things. This section presents overall progress towards the targets and a discussion of the evidence provided by projects in relation to this outcome in Year 3, as well as over the three years.

### Key findings for Year 3

#### Targeted Fund

- Increased levels of capacity and confidence were reported across all the Targeted Fund projects, with most organisations meeting their Year 3 annual target. Standout examples included YDance, who successfully increased confidence in 283 of their 303 participants, accounting for 93%
- Positive outcomes relating to confidence were gained through participants building connections with other participants, as well as tutors. Being able to share their work with others and receive feedback helped them to recognise their own successes, however slight. One to one support was particularly effective in this, enabling a more in-depth reflection and honesty than can sometimes be achieved in peer groups. Furthermore, it was seen as critical that the tutors facilitated 'safe spaces' where the young people felt welcomed and confident, where they would be listened to without judgement
- There were two overarching challenges underlying building capacity and confidence in the young participants. First, being able to consistently resource one to ones to all participants who needed it. Ambitious participation targets and rotation of staff meant that there wasn't always enough funding, capacity or time allocation to guarantee all participants independent support. Second, ensuring that participants take part in the follow-up monitoring and evaluation activity. This meant that successes and

incremental value added wasn't always possible to evidence, even when known). Many of the projects plan to focus more on non-intrusive, but meaningful, evaluation approaches in their future programming.

“ The interconnectedness of Hot Chocolate's programmes and activities have enabled young people to feel a sense of safety and belonging, and CashBack projects have enabled a gateway to that wider network of opportunity, community, and support.

- Hot Chocolate (Targeted Fund)

#### Open Fund

- Most Open Fund organisations reported that participants trying new things regularly led to new skills and achievements. The challenge for these projects was motivating the young people to 'give it a go' in the first instance. From this, the young people gained confidence in their abilities and their capacity to (successfully) try other new things in the future. Role models and guest speakers were an effective approach to encourage participants to try it for themselves
- Successful projects were able to build confidence and capacity through providing the opportunity for young people to work within small teams to collectively create work within a safe and relaxed environment. Some projects reported how this allowed participants to work with others like themselves, and be supported by experts to express themselves freely, without judgement
- The opportunity for participants to feed directly into the design and execution of the activities was effective in empowering the young people and making them feel valued and owning their own development (e.g. Modo-Circus with Purpose)
- Similarly, the opportunity to create physical work that could then be exhibited or performed, inspired the young people to believe in themselves and view themselves and their abilities as valuable (e.g. TD1 Music Project).

“ Here is not like school, we can work at our own pace, on our own project, choose to engage with other’s if we want to and the makerspace is a cool and inspiring place.

Participant, M-Tech Paisley project by the YMCA (Open Fund)

### Key findings for Targeted Fund across all years

- By the end of the programme, most projects had either met or surpassed their target. Specific success was achieved in encouraging participants to try something new, which was often considered a big achievement in itself
- In some specific cases, projects were not able to meet their overall participation target figures, as they achieved a higher than expected retention rate. In some cases, they took the executive decision to prioritise sustained support for returning young people, rather than continuously attracting new participants
- Unsurprisingly, numerous organisations reported that the greatest impact was seen in those who more regularly returned, benefiting from more personalised and in-depth support
- Some projects were overly ambitious in what they were able to deliver. This was, in part, due to an underestimation of the resource required to sustain and build partners providing participants
- Many organisations reported that building individual confidence, especially given the high number of young people who have low self-esteem and interpersonal challenges, is the first step that enables the other outcomes the programme was aiming to achieve
- The most impactful organisations were those who were able to work effectively in ensuring a safe space for participants feeling they belong, led by a person-centred approach, with consistent feedback and encouragement. With the young people taking the lead, they prioritise the significance of individual identity, where the programme responds to individual needs.

**Figure 7 Progress towards targets in building capacity and confidence - based on grant offer letter – Year 3**

	Targeted Fund		Open Fund		Programme Total		Variance
	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	
Young people report their confidence increasing	2,045	2,183	2,500	2,329	4,545	4,512	-33
Young people feel able to do new things	2,054	2,183	2,500	2,368	4,554	4,551	-3
Young people go on to do new things after their initial CashBack involvement	N/A	1,902	N/A	N/A	N/A	1,902	N/A
Stakeholders report on increasing confidence/capacity of young people	75%	100%	75%	N/A	75%	100%	+25%

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

**Figure 8 Progress towards targets in building capacity and confidence - based on grant offer letter – All years**

	Targeted Fund		Open Fund		Programme Total		Variance
	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	
Young people report their confidence increasing	6,000	5,644	7,500	5,218	13,500	10,862	-2,638
Young people feel able to do new things	6,000	5,469	7,500	5,227	13,500	10,696	-2,804
Young people go on to do new things after their initial CashBack involvement	N/A	3,223	N/A	0	N/A	3,223	N/A
Stakeholders report on increasing confidence/capacity of young people	75%	93.5%	75%	N/A	75%	93.5%	+18.5%

### Key programme learning

- Recognise that there is a logical sequence for ‘additional’ outcomes to be achieved; that confidence to participate in something new is often the first step for certain young people, and that further progress takes time and resources, particularly for the most vulnerable young people
- Encourage a balance between retention of existing participants between quarters and years of delivery and engaging new participants in activities. This should also be flexible to community needs and project developments wherever possible.

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

# Case study 1: PILOT, Firefly Arts

## What is PILOT?

PILOT taps into strategic and community partnerships to engage and sustain activity with West Lothian's most vulnerable young people. Partners include New Directions, West Lothian HYPE and MCMC programmes, West Lothian Young Carers, and Bathgate Academy's alternative curriculum Unit.

Participants have a wide range of needs, aspirations, skills and interests. They included young people not in education, training or employment, young adults with learning and communication impairment, early school leavers, young people in and after care systems, those deemed at risk of harmful, criminal or antisocial behaviours, as well as young people affected by emotional and mental health difficulties.

Project activity included digital installation, music, drama and performance, parkour, dance, lighting and sound design skills. In 2019, the project hosted six informal sharing evenings, where participants performed, exhibited or presented work and achievements to the wider public.

## Impacts on the participants and organisation

Many of Firefly's participants are excluded from communities or education because of barriers, physical, societal and emotional. An empathetic approach aims to overcome these and establish trust in the adults in the room. Establishing rules of behaviour enables a trusting atmosphere, brings out individual personalities and helps them create and feel proud of their achievements.

Allowing young people to 'walk in other's shoes' increases confidence. Working on Hamlet one week and parkour with superheroes the next encourages creative responses – from participants and practitioners alike. Creating a supportive environment encourages those who, for example, previously believed some challenges might be too physically difficult, to succeed and see themselves in a different light. Within the room they have real responsibilities and deadlines and the value of collaborative working becomes evident.

Recognising the value of each role and the benefits of team working – at micro and macro level – enables them to begin to build communities and social skills.

Some have previously struggled to leave their homes but begin to socialise and make friends through the Firefly groups. This enables young people to be fully part of their own communities and to maintain links and friendships formed to maintain support.

Increasing confidence leads to progress in skills acquisition and employability is enhanced in this cohort. Participants have gone on to study art or drama; others sign up to singing competitions or dance lessons. These are significant achievements and establish a proactive rather than passive approach to life. Enabling them to reflect on achievements helps realisation of the extent of change among themselves.

## Successes, challenges and learning

Partnership working relies on strong relationships and Firefly has been fortunate to have good links with local groups established via previous CashBack projects. One of the most successful elements of has been consistency and time.

“ It takes real effort to get best value for each person.

Three-year funding enabled partner relations to be built and long-term success aimed towards. For example, the CashBack Film Club established a group who can work at professional standard and are self-determined and self-motivated. They can take ownership and make films about subjects important to them. It has also enabled them to play.

“ We are talking about transformation here. It's about realistic goals and aspirations, takes a long time and the benefits are long term.

- Senior Theatre Arts Practitioner



- Senior Theatre Arts Practitioner

Establishing trust, working together as an ensemble, experiential learning and relying on each other are vital to success.

Sometimes communities need projects to come to them and this requires long term involvement. West Lothian has several remote towns and villages with poor transport links. This project used a mix of delivery at the Firefly base as well as outreach activities in remote areas and schools, working in partnership with community workers and teachers and culminating in work presented in Firefly's theatre to enable a professional experience.

Working with young people struggling within the school programme, the aim was to help get them back into a mainstream school community. Participants often have chaotic lives and enabling them to participate in this programme within school premises and school day offered important reintegration opportunities.

Recognising that young people have ideas and enabling them to bring those to life through exercises and workshops, making their own performance, is empowering. Firefly participants come up with ideas, build sets, light, operate, sources and make own props and costumes and perform. The role of the artist/practitioner working with the young people is to make ideas work, to develop them, while recognising the individual needs of the group.

“ By empowering them to develop their own ideas they can see their achievement.

Artists and practitioners report their own development alongside that of participants. Learning to adapt to developing situations in the room and involving participants in interactive ways by making the workspaces as creative as possible is reported as challenging but rewarding.

CashBack targets mean there is a constant need to engage new participants and this can conflict with the need to establish long term relationships.

“ True investment is time, comfortable environments, with consistent workshop methodologies to get them all comfortable and working together. Nurturing is an organic process and we must be able to respond quickly to what's going on in the room.

## 5. Developing physical and personal skills

The individual projects of the CashBack for Creativity programme covered a wealth of artforms. These include music, dance, radio broadcasting, filmmaking, theatre production, amongst others. With such a broad range of project designs and participant cohorts, the range of physical and personal skills that could be developed are equally broad. Most projects funded by CashBack for Creativity focused on nurturing creativity (e.g. song writing, choreography) and the technical skills that enable creative expression (e.g. music production).

### Key findings for Year 3

#### Targeted Fund

- Targeted Fund projects exceeded their total intended number of accreditations by 281.
- All projects evidenced that they successfully provided a strong mix of technical skills (e.g. music and film production, dance, drama and public speaking) and social skills (e.g. teamwork, communication, empathy). These were particularly vital and unique for some target groups, such as YDance's work with the Scottish Prison Service
- Young people were able to identify that they had an expanding skillset because of participation in the projects. Projects frequently outlined the specific skills that participants wanted to develop in advance of their participation, and where possible offer bespoke content and support to target these skills gaps (e.g. Reeltime).

#### Open Fund

- The variety of projects in the Open Fund meant participants were able to develop technical skills across music, drama, arts and crafts, dance and photography. These included music production and editing, dance choreography and performance, film editing, amongst others

- Soft skills across most Open Fund project included teamwork, communication, leadership, planning, and mutual support, as well as learning how to creatively process ideas and feelings. This was especially significant for those who had not taken part in mainstream education and social groups, or have additional learning needs
- Successes in providing personal and physical skills were found in those projects who, like TD1 Music Project, gave time for mentors to develop their own ways of working based on the needs of the participants.

### Key findings for Targeted Fund across all years

- Whilst accreditation targets were not met for many of the Targeted Fund organisations, where they were provided it had significant impact on the participants. Often participants had dropped out of formal education before they had received formal qualifications. Achieving such an accreditation helped legitimise their commitment to the course, as well as providing something tangible to share for future employment and educational opportunities
- As with annual reports, projects successful provided a wide range of skills (soft/hard/technical) to the young people, especially when working with a wide range of partners who could play to their strengths, providing a 'spectrum of engagements'
- Several organisations reflected on how Arts Award took longer and demanded more resources than expected, with 'many participants dropping out before they had finished'. For certain groups Arts Award wasn't appropriate or significant for them
- There were several notable successful mechanisms organisations adopted for developing physical and personal skills. First, effective partner delivery for meeting accreditation target. Here, they were able to contract programming related to accreditation. Second, have regular discussions on appropriateness of accreditation at a programme level. For example, YDance found the accreditation being 'a really useful device', as participations were in prison with little distractions or other commitments.

Whilst Hot Chocolate, where participation is much more fluid, found that drop ins and multi-level types of engagements were ill fitted with the requirements of certain accreditations but provided an appropriate means of engagement for their communities.

**Figure 10 Progress towards targets in developing physical and personal skills – based on grant offer letter – All years**

	Targeted Fund		Open Fund		Programme Total		Variance
	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	
Young people gain accreditation for learning and skills development	1,350	1,315	N/A	1,840	1,350	3,155	+1,805
Young people report their skills are increasing	6,000	5,204	7,500	4,199	13,500	9,403	-4,097
Stakeholders report on increased skills in young people	75%	100%	75%	N/A	75%	100%	+25%

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

### Key programme learning

- Consider asking organisations to scope in detail how they will resource accreditations throughout projects and signpost to any additional support available
- Enable a flexible evaluation approach to be adopted by projects to better demonstrate skills development where accreditations are not deemed appropriate.

**Figure 9 Progress towards targets in developing physical and personal skills – based on grant offer letter – Year 3**

	Targeted Fund		Open Fund		Programme Total		Variance
	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	
Young people gain accreditation for learning and skills development	515	796	N/A	709	515	1,505	+990
Young people report their skills are increasing	1,960	1,905	2,500	1,755	4,460	3,660	-800
Stakeholders report on increased skills in young people	75%	100%	75%	N/A	75%	100%	+25%

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

## Case study 2: Stretch, Hot Chocolate

### What is Stretch?

Based in Dundee, Hot Chocolate is a youth led arts organisation working with 12-25-year olds, and often including long term participant involvement to foster responsive and collaborative working.

The Stretch project enables participants to 'spread their creative wings', developing confidence personally, socially and creatively – whatever their starting point. Engagement begins in three ways:

- As audience: Experiencing the arts in diverse settings, broadening their understanding and enjoyment of different creative spaces – theatre, to cinema, to exhibitions, to industry visits, to festivals, talks, and shows
- As maker: The chance to get their hands dirty, through tasters, workshops, commissions, and collaborations, working with the best creatives and organisations, growing their sense of identity as creative individuals
- As curator: Going deeper, thinking critically, and taking responsibility, leading to showcasing through curating exhibitions, staging performance, and art directing publications.

In Year 3 of the Stretch project, the focus has been on 'space' and incorporates digital space, physical environment and headspace.

### Impacts on the participants and organisation

Partnership working connects Hot Chocolate to the wider creative sector in Dundee and beyond. Projects with Dundee Contemporary Arts help young people connect with specialists and the creative landscape of the city, leading some to a career path through aspirational connections and involvement in events, such as Dundee Degrees Shows, the Dundee Design Festival or Neon Digital Arts Festival. Young people can feel they have a minimal part to play in the city's festivals, and progression mapping has enabled them to understand how individual ventures fit into the bigger picture.

Long term involvement in drop in sessions also has significant impact on individuals in terms of skills and personal development. Some young people are nurturing and developing creative talent but can encounter barriers which youth workers help navigate through. Others believe they aren't creative at all but have been surprised by their own capacity once involved in individual projects. The Stretch project has embraced the spectrum from low end playful and therapeutic engagements, to skills-based development exercises to curation and exhibition. The diversity of opportunities meant that young people become involved outside their comfort zone and natural specialism.

Talking to participants they mention the huge difference between involvement in creative projects here and at school.

“ Here we are doing creative projects that are fun. It's definitely more creative here because at school you are forced to do what they want you to do and that could be difficult for people.

For the organisation this project enabled increased capacity, changed their profile both in Dundee and further afield, and enabled strong and lasting relationships with the creative sector to emerge and consolidate.

“ The three years versus a year's project gives the space to develop and learn and shift and adjust. But even three years goes so quickly.

- Chief Arts Lead

Andy Robertson, Chief Arts Lead, also reports his personal development has been enhanced through opportunities to engage with external creative networks and to participate in leadership programmes.

### Successes, challenges and learning

Hot Chocolate's projects are participant led and this approach makes mapping out exactly what will happen over 3 years a challenge. Their planning looked

exhaustively at one project, used as an example of how each could work and deliver. This worked well and successfully established a framework.

One exemplar venture involved curating and delivering one week of Dundee's Pecha Kucha Night, working with Creative Dundee. While planning, participants suggested a graffiti artist they would all like to hear from – thinking it was a jokey suggestion. Creative Dundee ran with the idea and the artist came along and ran a six-week graffiti school.

“ [The Pecha Kucha Night] brought everything a lot closer in terms of aspiration. Previously they had thought of him as a creative genius, on a pedestal, only available for the few, but after the workshops realised the value of making connections across the city and making their own opportunities

- Chief Arts Lead

Of the Pecha Kucha Night and her involvement one participant said:

“ It makes you more confident in yourself. You're learning a new skill and then you're like “Oh I can do this. This is great” and then you think “I want to do it more” because it's something that you're interested in because you can do it for yourself.

- Participant, Stretch by Hot Chocolate

Several young people from the project have subsequently become part of the internal volunteering programme and have tracked their involvement and commitment through Saltire awards. Though not a direct part of the CashBack project, this has often involved using skills learnt to run workshops and events for other young people.

## 6. Having a positive change on behaviour and aspiration

While some behavioural changes were reported in projects, it is also important to remember that many, if not most, of the participants are not being targeted because they have behavioural difficulties. It was also reported by some projects that it was difficult to measure a clear increase in changed aspirations due to the short-term nature of some projects (and a programme focus on constantly engaging new participants), or that young people found it difficult to explain their development on these terms. Stakeholders clearly reported improved aspirations among participants.

### Key findings for Year 3

#### Targeted Fund

- In Year 3 of the programme, most projects met their targets for participants demonstrating increased aspiration, as well as positive changes in their behaviour, as a result of taking part in the programme. This was reflected by stakeholder testimonies
- Young people have been given the time, space and guidance to be able to have valuable ‘what if’ moments. This enabled participants to discover and discuss what further development opportunities are available to them to get them to the next stage of their personal or career development
- Successful projects were able to build trust, consistency, as well as clear and agreed parameters. These were welcomed by and enabled vulnerable and marginalised young people to learn and progress
- Some participants had previous issues with formal educational systems, with poor attendance and antisocial behaviour. Tutors noted that the informal environment and participant-led approach facilitated openness and allowed participants to speak more freely and discuss their concerns more than they may in formal education environments. This had a positive impact on their interpersonal behaviour.

“ Participants and other people have also shared with us that they felt like the young people have better structure and routine with their day to day life due to maintaining their appointments, have developed their social skills and have established meaningful relationships and rapport with others in particular within the group settings.

- Quarriers (Targeted Fund)

#### Open Fund

- Positive changes to participants’ behaviour and aspirations were both explicit and implicit. On one end of the spectrum, there were clear and sustained changes in behaviour and aspirations, with participants for the first time recognising their creative skills and the programme’s artform as a legitimate aspiration focus for themselves (e.g. TD1 Music Project participants now wishing to pursue a music career). Whilst on the other end of the spectrum, more subtle but still significant changes were seen in participants’ sustained engagement over long periods of time, as well as exercising new time management skills
- Creative practice was recognised as an effective method to express themselves in a positive and operative way (e.g. Listen Lanarkshire)
- Sustained positive change was achieved by ‘identifying achievable goals in a step by step manner’, with increments achieved via ongoing application and discussion with the artist facilitators (e.g. D&G Innovation Project)
- Public exhibitions created a sense of pride and made participants realise that they can produce work of worth, which in turn changed their outlook on their futures positively (e.g. Spark of Genius)
- Having a flexible timetable, which changed with the group dynamic, was especially successful for participants to adapt around their daily lives (e.g. Parkour Bridges)



- The opportunity to work with artists and creative industry professionals helped participants be more open minded to the arts and believe that they could forge a (viable) career for themselves in the sector. This was reported across several projects, especially for the Lyth Arts Centre Young Company
- Creative expression allowed for the young people to make mistakes, and through this they were enabled to talk about and explore their goals and aspirations. Young people were given clear leadership and decision-making positions in the Paisley YMCA project, which they noted empowered them to feel capable to go on and achieve other things beyond the project itself.

### Key findings for Targeted Fund across all years

End of Project reports outlined many of the same key impacts related to increased aspiration and as positive changes in their behaviour, as highlighted in the Year 3 annual reports. In addition, Targeted Fund organisations reported:

- Art and creativity recognised by participants as a positive medium for expression, as opposed to resorting to negative behaviours when they felt they could not express themselves in other ways
- Changes in behaviour and aspirations are long-term outcomes, which some organisations highlighted need to be better measured over time. Similarly, that there's a need to remember structural barriers that the CashBack for Creative programme is unable to change, such as deprivation levels and caring responsibilities
- MCR Pathways successfully impacted on participants' aspirations by working closely with employers to design interactive half day work placements with a wide range of their workforce delivering different elements. This was key to raising aspirations amongst young people as they developed a practical knowledge of the range of roles within each creative organisation, thus challenging young people on their perceptions of types of job and the variety of potential roles they could aspire to within the creative industries.

**Figure 11 Progress towards targets having positive change on behaviour and aspiration – based on grant offer letter – Year 3**

	Targeted Fund		Open Fund		Programme Total		Variance
	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	
Young people report increased aspirations	2,129	2,107	2,500	1,663	4,629	3,770	-859
Young people report positive changes in their behaviour	2,258	1,762	2,500	1,346	4,758	3,108	-1,650
Stakeholders report on perceived increased aspirations in young people	75%	100%	75%	N/A	75%	100%	+25%

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

**Figure 12 Progress towards targets having positive change on behaviour and aspiration – based on grant offer letter – All years**

	Targeted Fund		Open Fund		Programme Total		Variance
	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	
Young people report increased aspirations	6,000	5,137	7,500	4,025	13,500	9,162	-4,338
Young people report positive changes in their behaviour	6,000	4,559	7,500	3,613	13,500	8,172	-5,328
Stakeholders report on perceived increased aspirations in young people	75%	100%	75%	N/A	75%	100%	+25%

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

### Key programme learning

- Not all young people need to change their behaviour. Outcomes such as this should be critically, rather than universally applied, and a more inclusive approach taken to such 'deficit'-focused outcomes
- Projects that were more successful in improving aspiration often worked with artists and cultural professionals as guest tutors or guest speakers to share what life is like in the sector. Working with professionals in parallel sectors

(e.g. education, community development) can also demonstrate to participants how they can aspire to previously unconsidered careers.

## Case Study 3: Macrobert-In, Macrobert Arts Centre

### What is Macrobert-In?

Macrobert is an arts centre based on campus at University of Stirling. At Macrobert they believe their work should be for everyone and strive to ensure the whole community has the opportunity to access and participate.

“Macrobert-In” was designed to reach out to young people who experience barriers to accessing the arts centre and their existing outreach work.

“ We wanted to use this opportunity to take our programme and activities into our communities, specifically to those disadvantaged financially, or by health and / or social reasons.

- Development Manager

In order to reach these target groups, new community partnerships had to be developed. Through co-hosting events with partners, as well as offering events at larger gatherings, they maximized reach, focusing on those who would not normally consider approaching the centre itself.

All sessions gave young people an opportunity to try their hand at a creative activity. Sessions offered dance / movement, drama, singing, art, filmmaking, craft and puppetry.

### Impact on participants and organisation

Macrobert has well established links with community organisations across their region, but focused on establishing and consolidating links with groups working with hard to engage young people. These included Doune and Deanston Youth Project working with isolated young people, Seamab, a school for in-care children and Reachout, a charity partner, which has since expressed interest in a longer-term relationship to continue working with young people with mental health problems.

As well as introducing new partners outside Macrobert’s walls, the project is designed to strengthen bonds within communities themselves.

“ We know the arts can draw people together in a way more powerful than anything else.

- Macrobert-In co-ordinator

Macrobert-In highlighted the fact that there are many isolated and vulnerable students on campus at the University. Macrobert are now working with the Student Services team to identify ways to target these individuals and are considering a Film Club as their first venture with this group.

At their core, many community partners focus on supporting the mental health of their participants. This was considered more for this project than for other Macrobert ventures and a focus on positive change and positive views of self was vital to success.

The project has allowed members of the staff team to develop new skills in project management, budgeting and working with vulnerable young people. This has been a particular boost for developing junior members of staff.

“ My time coordinating Macrobert-In has been invaluable in allowing me the chance to develop my project management skills. I have improved in planning, budgeting and even working practically with vulnerable young people within a drama and performance context. Beyond the project, I feel confident in going forward to develop these skills further and using what I have learned to benefit other areas of the organisation.

- Junior staff member

## Successes, challenges and learning

Initially the project was designed to offer day long workshops with community groups. Very early in the process, the team realised that this was too long for some participants. They adapted accordingly and offered flexible workshops for those who could not commit to a day-long event. This highlights the need to adapt and respond to participant needs.

This project worked with vulnerable young people, often in areas of multiple deprivation, many of whom would not normally take part in arts activity. This meant the delivery environment and group leadership was vitally important. Young people were, throughout, given opportunities to question and work through their feelings about the project and the team aimed for participants to take ownership and drive the project themselves, taking responsibility for the outcomes and thus feeling empowered. They were encouraged to share what worked and didn't through accessible evaluation methods (emojis, post it notes) as well as to feedback on the experience as a whole.

Some delivery was in school and the team sought to make that feel different to class; more learning through fun with art. Often they considered themes and subjects that might be explored in class but always with a different slant and often using topics as a way into project delivery.

All project delivery was outside the arts venue, but where possible visits were found to enhance connections. Some visited to see live performance, often for the first time. Ensuring these were high quality interventions, often enhanced by a workshop post performance, strengthened the potential for participants to feel at home in the venue and feel they could return without being part of a group. At Christmas it was noted that many participants attended the panto and other events for the first time whereas others continue contact through interactive project participation.

The team are trying to find different ways to continue working with Macrobert-In participants. For some, this might include developing bursaries to remove financial barriers and with increasingly fragile public support for arts they report this may be challenging.

## 7. Improving wellbeing

The outcome relating to wellbeing is informed by work that has gone into the SHANARRI indicators. The acronym SHANARRI relates to people feeling Safe; Healthy; Achieving; Nurtured; Active; Respected; Responsible; and Included. The research which led to the SHANARRI indicators has shown that different dimensions of wellbeing overlap and are both intrinsic, extrinsic, time-limited and contextual. This can make recording and reporting wellbeing according to SHANARRI indicators problematic. As with the other outcomes, discussions with projects indicated that it is likely these were underrepresented in the quantitative reports, but the qualitative accounts of participants' development more clearly represented outcomes across the different SHANARRI dimensions.

### Key findings for Year 3

#### Targeted Fund

- In Year 3 of the programme, most projects either met or surpassed their target for improving participants' wellbeing. This is significant given many of the projects work with participants with acute self-esteem and mental health problems
- Projects which had elements of physicality, such as dance and drama (e.g. YDance), participants reported feeling healthier, both physically and mentally
- There were two overarching challenges underlying the project's ability to improve participants' wellbeing. First, some young people found larger groups difficult to cope with, instead requiring more one to one attention. Second, some organisations found the SHANARRI indicators to be an overwhelming framework, where certain indicators were collected and reflective of progress, whilst others were not relevant or quantifiable
- There were several successful mechanisms organisations adopted for improving wellbeing amongst participants. These included focusing on the environment and facilitating a 'safe space' for free expression, away from their busy lives. Second, finding an effective balance between fun and calm.

Third, programming in public screening, presentations and events as a way for developing self-esteem and validation of their creative identities.

“ [The tutor] made a massive positive impact in my life and made sure I would keep fighting when I didn't think it was possible. Every time I came to class [The tutor] would always make sure I leave with a smile on my face! It was always my highlight of the week.

- Participant, YDance (Targeted Fund)

#### Open Fund

- Increased skills, networks and attainment, as well as greater aspirations had a direct impact on their wellbeing. Listen Lanarkshire participants spoke of how they felt more positive about themselves now they feel equipped with new radio technical skills and a 'path to follow'
- Like some Targeted Fund projects, it was noted that certain artforms fit particularly well with the SHANARRI wellbeing indicators. As a principally physical artform, Capall Dorcha Theatre Company spoke of how theatre performance enabled participants to be active, more healthy, included, and safe
- Young people learned that creativity is a tool they can use to express themselves and ease anxieties and frustrations (e.g. Sparks of Genius)
- Throughout the sessions, many participants established a peer network with each other, being able to freely discuss and work through their personal concerns and worries, independent of their home environment which may be challenging. TDI Music Project spoke of how group-led activities who learn together were able to share experiences and stories with each other, recognising mutual resilience to challenges. These networks had a positive impact on their personal wellbeing, as members were seen to share and reflect their own personal challenges with others and therefore have higher levels of empathy.

“ Being creative is a release, it’s allowing me to pore out my emotions into music making and performing and is a bit of mental respite.

- Participant, M-Tech Paisley project by the YMCA (Open Fund)

### Key findings for Targeted Fund across all years

- By the end of the programme, most projects had either met or surpassed their target, with a high percentage reporting improvement in their wellbeing. This is significant for the young people they work with, who often have acutely low self-esteem and personal, familial and societal challenges
- Successful projects observed how wellbeing was improved chiefly through the participants having something to look forward to, a project to work on, a way to express themselves, as well as perceiving themselves as on a ‘shared journey with others’, especially those with mental health problems. Some participants mention how artistic and creative processes were (informally) therapeutic for them
- Some projects reported achievements against ‘clusters’ of SHANARRI indicators, based on interviews with participants about ways the project had contributed to their experience on these terms
- Reflecting at the end of the programme, there were two overarching challenges underlying the project’s ability to improve participants’ wellbeing. First, as with other outcomes, improving wellbeing was seen as an outcome that needed to be measured over time, as it’s likely to vary from day to day, making sustained changes in wellbeing difficult to measure. Second, participants only partially completing surveys or not taking part in the follow up survey. This was a specific challenge for this outcome, given the breadth of SHANARRI indicators.
- Reflecting at the end of the programme, there were several successful mechanisms organisations adopted for improving wellbeing amongst participants. These included working in close partnership with key workers, support services, teachers, carers and parents to enable organisations to

meet the specific and personal needs of the young people. Similarly, facilitating the meeting of participants with similar interests and concerns, helping them to build communities and networks of support.

**Figure 13 Progress towards targets in improving participants’ wellbeing – based on grant offer letter – Year 3**

	Targeted Fund		Open Fund		Programme Total		Variance
	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	
Young people report increases in feelings against SHANARRI indicators	2,124	1,830	2,500	1,939	4,624	3,769	-855
Stakeholders report on perceived increases in SHANARRI indicators among young people	75%	91%	75%	N/A	75%	91%	+16%

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

**Figure 14 Progress towards targets in improving participants' wellbeing – based on grant offer letter – All years**

	Targeted Fund		Open Fund		Programme Total		Variance
	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	
Young people report increases in feelings against SHANARRI indicators	6,000	4,883	7,500	4,552	13,500	9,435	-4,065
Stakeholders report on perceived increases in SHANARRI indicators among young people	75%	100%	75%	N/A	75%	100%	+25%

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

### Key programme learning

- Bespoke training or support should be provided to organisations expected to report against SHANARRI indicators. It should also be clarified whether an outcome being met is recorded against progress in one, a selection, or all indicators and over which timeframes (i.e. one session, one 'term', or longer)
- Projects found it easier to report wellbeing outcomes in relation to more physical activities (e.g. dance, movement, performance), further work should be done with projects to explore how environmental and psycho-social creative processes are linked to SHANARRI outcomes. There is a strong

body of evidence linking creative practice with wellbeing, but many projects find it difficult to demonstrate these effects within the resources available.



## 8. Improving learning, employability and employment options (positive destinations) [Targeted Fund only]

At the core of the CashBack for Creativity programme is the intention for participants to progress into positive destinations. Positive destinations included further training and learning, progression into formal or non-formal learning opportunities within or beyond the delivery organisations, apprenticeship roles, amongst others.

The Targeted Fund had a range of targets for engaging young people in learning, training and employment, as well as enabling them to move into positive destinations once completing their participation.

It was anticipated that Open Fund projects would be less likely to achieve clear progression into positive destinations based on their lower grant amounts and generally shorter time spans of up to a year. However, some Open Fund projects did report data on positive destinations. These observations are included in this section.

It is important to note that the positive destinations expected for participants is highly contingent on the specific circumstances, needs and aspirations of the young people. Similarly, it's important to be mindful of varying project design and duration.

The total number of Targeted Fund participants in training or learning as part of the programme in Year 3 was 2,436, accounting for nearly half (46%) of the Fund's participants. By the end of the programme, a total of 7,203 participants had engaged with training or learning as part of the programme, accounting for half (51%) of the all Targeted Fund participants over the three years.

### Key findings for Year 3

#### Targeted Fund

- Of the data available, Targeted Fund projects had big successes in certain positive destinations, such as further informal learning opportunity with their organisation, as well as participants remaining at or returning to school. Whilst there was less successes in others, such as informal learning in other partner organisations and being employed in a Modern Apprenticeship
- Participants had poor or often very little experience of moving into learning or training settings, courses and / or employment. This was often because such progression routes were not part of their current goals
- Several projects reported a need to first work on the participants' soft skills. Participants' confidence, teamwork, time management, responsibility management, amongst others, were seen as the first stage outcomes which needed established before expecting participants to progress into positive destinations

Most projects promoted and brokered local training opportunities across adjacent organisations and colleges. Although it was also reported that these opportunities had to be made bespoke to individual participants to be most successful, rather than taking a 'cookie cutter approach'.

#### Open Fund

- Like some Targeted Fund projects, future partnerships and connections were enabled and developed, with partner organisations requesting that artists return and do further work following the programme, such as the TDI Music Project
- Barriers to attainment, such as lack of skills development and lack of focus, were reduced by providing opportunities to young people to develop at a pace that suited them and encouraging accreditation that can be adapted easily across art forms (e.g. Arts Award).

## Key findings for Targeted Fund across all years

### Targeted Fund

- By the end of the programme, most projects had either met or surpassed their target, especially for those continuing with informal learning at the host organisation
- Successful projects spoke about how they were able to broker onward destinations through careful project management, targeting young people who are likely to benefit, as well as effective partnership working. Having a wide range of progression pathways also allowed the participants to determine the next step that suited their own aspirations
- Successful projects were also those who were able to offer a range of progression pathways. For example, Firefly Arts were able to offer Dynamic Youth Award and Duke of Edinburgh Award schemes, workplace mentoring and experience, individual support into further education, training and employment, and took an active role in delivering public screenings, exhibitions and performance events
- A consistent challenge for projects across the three years was to ensure their partner relationships were able to facilitate follow-up engagement with participants.

### Key programme learning

- The definition of 'positive destinations' is relatively broad and should be agreed with projects on a case-by-case basis. For young people who are excluded from school a positive destination is a reorientation to education (recognising the likely complex structural barriers to actual re-entry into education), for those who need support to apply to college or an apprenticeship another set of activities and support is required. For some participants the opportunity to stay and progress within a project is the most positive destination (or 'location'). These will be largely context and cohort dependent, with flexibility of definition allowed
- Well-established and mutual partnerships are often key to enabling 'positive destinations' external to project activity. It should be acknowledged in

funding design and project planning that building and maintaining a range of appropriate partnerships will require time and resources.

**Figure 15 Where Targeted Fund participants have progressed to after completion of the programme (positive destinations) - Year 3**

Indicator	Grant offer letter target	Total achieved	Proportion of Targeted Fund participants achieving this outcome
# in training as part of the programme	-	714	13.5%
# in learning as part of the programme	-	1,722	32.5%
# in employment as part of the programme	-	0	0.0%
# in volunteering as part of the programme	-	0	0.0%
# progressing into a further informal learning opportunity in your organisation	-	420	7.9%
# progressing into a further informal learning opportunity in another organisation	-	425	8.0%
# remaining at or returning to school	-	653	12.3%
# taking a course of further or higher education	-	192	3.6%
# undertaking a Skills Development Scotland-funded training programme	-	8	0.2%
# engaging in an Activity Agreement	-	24	0.5%
# participating in learning or training offered by Third Sector providers / Social Enterprises / Community Learning and Development	-	56	1.1%
# volunteering work experience, where it is part of a recognised course or programme	-	30	0.6%
# engaged with Community Jobs Scotland	-	1	0.0%
# being employed / a Modern Apprenticeship	-	106	2.0%
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,330</b>		

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

**Figure 16 Where Targeted Fund participants have progressed to after completion of the programme (positive destinations) – All years**

Indicator	Grant offer letter target	Total achieved	Proportion of participants achieving this outcome
# in training as part of the programme	-	1,143	8.0%
# in learning as part of the programme	-	6,060	42.5%
# in employment as part of the programme	-	0	0.0%
# in volunteering as part of the programme	-	0	0.0%
# progressing into a further informal learning opportunity in your organisation	-	1,265	8.9%
# progressing into a further informal learning opportunity in another organisation	-	745	5.2%
# remaining at or returning to school	-	2,201	15.4%
# taking a course of further or higher education	-	283	2.0%
# undertaking a Skills Development Scotland-funded training programme	-	9	0.1%
# engaging in an Activity Agreement	-	147	1.0%
# participating in learning or training offered by Third Sector providers / Social Enterprises / Community Learning and Development	-	102	0.7%
# volunteering work experience, where it is part of a recognised course or programme	-	81	0.6%
# engaged with Community Jobs Scotland	-	2	0.0%
# being employed / a Modern Apprenticeship	-	144	1.0%
<b>Total</b>	<b>3,200</b>		

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

## 9. Participating in positive activity

One of the key elements of the CashBack for Creativity fund is to enable young people who are less likely to have the opportunity to engage, as well as sustain their engagement in, positive activities.

Positive activity relates to providing access opportunities as a fundamental right for all children and young people in Scotland, particularly those with less access to cultural and creative resources.

It is important to consider the total numbers of participants taking part in something new and sustaining their participation, before progress is measured in relation to developmental outcomes or progression pathways.

### Key findings for Year 3

#### Targeted Fund

- Of the data available for Year 3, in general Targeted Fund projects surpassed their target for, those who were new to the type of activity, and successfully encouraged sustained participation
- The ease of accessibility meant thousands of young people benefitted from positive activity, which they would not have otherwise (e.g. due to financial constraints or other barriers). In this sense, the focus of Phase 4 on specific target groups and particularly those living in the most deprived areas has been a positive development
- Many projects had success in retaining participants over the long-term and reported that positive and trusting relationships between the organisation, tutors and young people, were core to sustained participation. This allowed the young people to self-define their relationship with the project, and often get involved in one part of the project, connect with the art and other young people, before getting drawn into other engagements
- Several projects spoke of a need for a balance of different kinds of activity to attract and sustain participation, such as taster sessions in groups, as well as work drop-in sessions.

“ My experience at YDance has definitely changed me and my positivity towards myself. I always look forward to attending and seeing the group each week knowing that there’s nothing to be intimidated by and that everyone will support each other.

- Participant from North Ayrshire, YDance (Targeted Fund)

#### Open Fund

- Activities gave participants focus and direction, providing a project and task that they could come back to work on and improve
- For participants with learning difficulties, creative practices were seen to have a range of positive effects. For example, participants of the D&G Innovation Project were supported in their transition from school into young adult life, empowered by a peer-to-peer network, where friendships can grow in a supportive environment
- Open Fund projects also reported that it was important to establish the correct level of challenge for participants for them to have a positive experience and sustain participation. Many participants hadn’t realised that creative work would be challenging in the way they expected (e.g. when compared to more traditionally ‘academic’ subjects).

### Key findings for Targeted Fund across all years

- By the end of the programme, most projects had either met or surpassed their target, with the majority achieving high sustained participation, despite many being new to the activity
- For those who did not sustain their participation, this was largely due to personal issues, with existing challenges with attendance in school, homelessness, and mental health
- Many projects reported how it was important that the sessions were fun and created positive energy for those taking part. Making the point that many

participants had to feel a positive response to their experience to commit, although this could come from the right level of challenge

- Successful mechanisms organisations adopted for attracting and then sustaining participation included giving an initial focus to developing participants' personal and social skills (e.g. confidence, teamwork, time management), before expecting them to engage further, and encouraging participants to invite friends to the programme (e.g. YDance's 'Bring A Friend' strategy).

**Figure 17 Progress towards targets in participants participating in positive activity – based on grant offer letter – Year 3**

	Targeted Fund		Open Fund		Programme Total		Variance
	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	
Number participating in the activity	2,762	2,154	3,334	3,019	6,096	5,173	-923
Number who were new to this type of activity	2,015	1,803	2,000	1,892	4,015	3,695	-320
Number sustaining participation	1,638	1,955	2,500	1,381	4,138	3,336	-802

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

**Figure 18 Progress towards targets in participants participating in positive activity – based on grant offer letter – All years**

	Targeted Fund		Open Fund		Programme Total		Variance
	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	Grant offer letter target	Actual	
Number participating in the activity	8,000	6,582	10,000	7,303	18,000	13,885	-4,115
Number who were new to this type of activity	6,000	5,255	7,500	5,267	13,500	10,522	-2,978
Number sustaining participation	4,800	5,830	6,000	5,341	10,800	11,171	+371

Source: Creative Scotland / BOP Consulting (2020)

### Key programme learning

- Programme success will depend on getting people through the door and keeping them participating. It is important to offer a range of accessible activities, coupled with an offer of progression opportunities for those showing an interest. This will likely need to be adapted for different groups (e.g. age groups, level of experience, additional challenges faced) and requires flexible support from funders as a result.

## 10. Key project learning

In their End of Project reports CashBack for Creativity Phase 4, funded projects across the Targeted Fund and Open Fund were asked to share what they would do differently, should the programme be repeated. This provides further valuable insights into lessons learned and specific challenges projects faced.

### Targeted Fund

- Most projects reported they would implement changes in both organisational delivery and how they work with partners. One organisation indicated they would focus on broader training of staff, to overcome their challenge of high staff turnover. This would be applicable to both tutors, but also administrative aspects of the monitoring and evaluation. They would also focus on building stronger partnerships with partners who are already working and have an existing relationship with young people within their target groups in advance. They could then work more closely together to further increase these participants' skills and aspirations
- Several organisations suggested they would work with smaller groups over a longer period, investing more time in each participant. This draws from the widespread insight that more in-depth, personal and (where possible) one to one support enabled greater individual and cohort-wide impact. This was linked to a perception that there is a general pressure for scale over impact from most funders.
- Allocate funds to further build organisational capacity (e.g. a fixed-term in-house tech and digital specialist, or designated monitoring and evaluation officer) on a longer-term basis, rather than short-term contracts
- Build in longer lead time for participants to feed directly into programme design. One organisation indicated they would enable more time for tutors to work with participants to design a user-led approach to the support that would suit them, rather than designing a programme application in isolation and then immediately feeling pressured to start delivery

- Find time to celebrate successes, both for empowering and building the confidence of the participants (e.g. through showcases and exhibitions), but also the project's staff teams. One project spoke of how the efforts and flexibility of their staff needs to be given due celebration and thanks, motivating them to continue providing high quality support and care.

### Open Fund

- Several Open Fund projects suggested they would run smaller, more focused activities if the CashBack for Creativity programme was to be repeated. Here more time would be given to specific individual needs and personal development.
- Build materials and administrative time budgets into the one funding application to ensure all elements are in place, reducing risks inherent in the 'vagaries of Local Authority spending cuts, restructuring and match funding complexity'
- Instil co-design throughout the project, with more reflection points for participants to both reflect on their progress, but also whether the adopted pedagogical approach is working effectively with the specific group or individuals

### Key programme learning for future evaluation

- Many organisations in Phase 4 found the number of outcomes they were expected to report against difficult to manage, both in terms of programme design and monitoring and evaluation. An opportunity to select fewer, more specific and bespoke, outcomes against overarching programme impacts (set more generically) would be welcomed
- This could be complemented with more resource for evaluation support at the project level and budget setting in general (e.g. recommending funding for staff training and development in monitoring and evaluation, pre-delivery)
- More flexibility in participant number targets would also be welcomed. Some projects reported that they recruited fewer participants because there was a greater appetite (and opportunity) for progression for existing participants.



Others considered it a strong impact if they were able to unexpectedly attract a large number of young people to a new activity. Reconsidering how impact is defined (i.e. towards meaningful change and away from participant numbers) would also encourage a stronger culture of evaluation at all levels. Enabling projects to set 'ceiling/floor margins' for expected participant numbers could be considered

- Targeted Fund projects reported positive operational impacts from being brought together with others doing similar work for mutual learning, particularly when this could involve management *and* delivery staff. Understanding the mechanisms that lead to positive project impact in this way could be advanced using a 'community of practice' approach among organisations with similar professional interests (e.g. across sectors within localities, or across localities within sectors)
- A tension was identified between generating positive news stories for promoting the 'CashBack for Creativity' brand and ability to report critical learning or negative impact. This should also be considered in programme marketing, communications and advocacy plans and expectations, and kept separate where possible.

# Appendices

**Figure 19 CashBack for Creativity Open Fund Year 3 organisations - spend by organisation**

<b>Organisation</b>	<b>Local Authority</b>	<b>Actual spend</b>
Modo - Circus with Purpose	Aberdeenshire	£8,000.00
Showcase the Street	Angus	£6,252.00
Barnardo's	Angus	£6,200.00
Campbeltown Community Business Ltd T/A Campbeltown Picture House	Argyll and Bute	£9,920.00
CHArts	Argyll and Bute	£10,000.00
Muirhouse Youth Development Group	City of Edinburgh	£4,148.00
The Big Project	City of Edinburgh	£3,388.00
WHALE Arts Agency	City of Edinburgh	£5,697.00
Gilmerton Community Centre Association/Reel Youth Media	City of Edinburgh	£6,100.00
Edinburgh City Youth Cafe	City of Edinburgh	£1,125.00
Ochil Youths Community Improvement CIC	Clackmannanshire	£9,510.00
Better Lives Partnership	Dumfries and Galloway	£10,000.00
Oasis Youth Management Committee	Dumfries and Galloway	£8,167.00
Feeling Strong	Dundee City	£8,571.35
Centrestage Communities Ltd	East Ayrshire	£9,900.00
Barnardos Scotland	Falkirk	£8,196.00
Falkland Stewardship Trust	Fife	£9,000.00
Gallatown Bike Hub	Fife	£4,670.00
PEEK Possibilities for Each and Every Kid	Glasgow North East	£10,000.00
Indepen-dance(Scotland) Ltd	Glasgow North East	£3,705.73
Toonspeak Young People's Theatre	Glasgow North East	£7,125.00
The Pavillion (Greater Easterhouse)	Glasgow North East	£9,350.00

Produced Moon	Glasgow North East	£7,325.00
HOPE AMPLIFIED	Glasgow North East	£6,336.00
Royston Youth Action	Glasgow North East	£6,670.00
Achieve More Scotland	Glasgow North West	£9,550.00
The Village Storytelling Centre	Glasgow South	£9,174.00
ATLAS Arts	Highland	£1,227.00
Lyth Arts Centre LTD	Highland	£9,926.00
Youth Connections	Inverclyde	£3,285.00
Capall Dorcha Theatre Company	North Ayrshire	£5,898.00
Connect Project - Voluntary Action Orkney	Orkney Islands	£4,248.70
Remode Renfrewshire	Renfrewshire	£6,399.50
Paisley YMCA	Renfrewshire	£9,339.00
Kibble Education and Care Centre	Renfrewshire	£7,020.00
Eildon West Youth Hub (TD1 Youth Hub)	Scottish Borders	£7,438.00
YouthBorders	Scottish Borders	£9,980.00
Ayr Gaiety Partnership	South Ayrshire	£10,000.00
Barnardo's Scotland	South Ayrshire	£5,000.00
Scottish Youth Film Festival	South Ayrshire	£9,900.00
Southside Film Festival CIC	South Lanarkshire	£4,095.00
Cambuslang Universal Connections	South Lanarkshire	£8,896.00
Tolbooth (Stirling Council)	Stirling	£6,843.00
RIG Arts	West Dunbartonshire	£6,806.40
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>£320,281.68</b>
	<b>AVERAGE PER LOCAL AUTHORITY</b>	<b>£7,161.82</b>

Source: Creative Scotland (2020)

**Figure 20 CashBack for Creativity Open Fund Year 3 organisations – spend by Local Authority**

<b>Local Authority</b>	<b>No. of organisations funded</b>	<b>Total Actual spend</b>	<b>Average Actual Spend</b>
Aberdeenshire	1	£8,000.00	£8,000.00
Angus	2	£12,452.00	£6,226.00
Argyll and Bute	2	£19,920.00	£9,960.00
City of Edinburgh	5	£20,458.00	£4,091.60
Clackmannanshire	1	£9,510.00	£9,510.00
Dumfries and Galloway	2	£18,167.00	£9,083.50
Dundee City	1	£8,571.35	£8,571.35
East Ayrshire	1	£9,900.00	£9,900.00
Falkirk	1	£8,196.00	£8,196.00
Fife	2	£13,670.00	£6,835.00
Glasgow North East	7	£50,511.73	£7,215.96
Glasgow North West	1	£9,550.00	£9,550.00
Glasgow South	1	£9,174.00	£9,174.00
Highland	2	£11,153.00	£5,576.50
Inverclyde	1	£3,285.00	£3,285.00
North Ayrshire	1	£5,898.00	£5,898.00
North Lanarkshire	1	£5,900.00	£5,900.00
Orkney Islands	1	£4,248.70	£4,248.70
Renfrewshire	3	£22,758.50	£7,586.17
Scottish Borders	2	£17,418.00	£8,709.00
South Ayrshire	3	£24,900.00	£8,300.00
South Lanarkshire	2	£12,991.00	£6,495.50
Stirling	1	£6,843.00	£6,843.00
West Dunbartonshire	1	£6,806.40	£6,806.40
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>£320,281.68</b>	<b>£7,161.26</b>

Source: Creative Scotland (2020)

**Figure 21 CashBack for Creativity Targeted Fund organisations – Year 3 and project spend by organisation**

<b>Organisation</b>	<b>Project</b>	<b>Local authority</b>	<b>Year 3 Actual spend</b>	<b>All years Actual spend</b>
Citymoves	Project Strive	Aberdeen City	£31,884	£95,465
Eden Court	Eden Court Creative - CashBack	Highland / Moray	£40,080	£120,000
Findhorn Bay Arts	In The Mix	Moray	£39,955	£119,625
Firefly	PILOT	West Lothian	£38,744	£116,000
Hot Chocolate	Stretch	Dundee City	£38,907	£116,491
MCR Pathways	Young Glasgow Talent	Glasgow	£27,503	£82,345
Oasis Youth Centre (Dumfries & Galloway Council)	Urban Arts Project	Dumfries & Galloway	£34,252	£102,548
Platform	pARTicipation	Glasgow	£33,400	£100,000
Quarriers	Oh Yellow	Glasgow	£14,433	£43,213
Reeltime	Access to Music	North Lanarkshire	£22,319	£66,823
SEE	CashBack for Creativity	Edinburgh	£40,080	£120,000
SHMU	Youth Media Project	Aberdeen City	£40,080	£120,000
YDance	Take the Lead	Falkirk/North Ayrshire	£35,972	£107,700
YTAS	New Territory	Glasgow / Inverclyde / West Lothian / North Lanarkshire	£40,080	£120,000
Ysort it	CreActive Street Art	West Dunbartonshire	£40,012	£40,012
Dancebase		Edinburgh	Took part in Year 1 and 2 only	£39,653
		<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>£517,701</b>	<b>£1,393,384</b>

Source: Creative Scotland (2020)

**Figure 22 CashBack for Creativity Targeted Fund organisations – spend by Local Authority (Year 3)**

<b>Local Authority</b>	<b>No. of organisations funded</b>	<b>Total Actual spend</b>	<b>Average Actual Spend</b>
Aberdeen City	2	£71,964	£35,982
Dumfries & Galloway	1	£34,252	£34,252
Dundee City	1	£38,907	£38,907
Edinburgh	1	£40,080	£40,080
Falkirk/North Ayrshire	1	£35,972	£35,972
Glasgow	3	£75,336	£25,112
Glasgow / Inverclyde / West Lothian / North Lanarkshire	1	£40,080	£40,080
Highland / Moray	1	£40,080	£40,080
Moray	1	£39,955	£39,955
North Lanarkshire	1	£22,319	£22,319
West Dunbartonshire	1	£40,012	£40,012
West Lothian	1	£38,744	£38,744
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>£517,701</b>	

Source: Creative Scotland (2020)

**Figure 23 CashBack for Creativity Targeted Fund organisations – spend by Local Authority (All years)**

<b>Local Authority</b>	<b>No. of organisations funded</b>	<b>Total Actual spend</b>	<b>Average Actual Spend</b>
Aberdeen City	2	£215,465	£107,733
Dumfries & Galloway	1	£102,548	£102,548
Dundee City	1	£116, 491	£116, 491
Edinburgh	2	£159,653	£79,827
Falkirk/North Ayrshire	1	£107,700	£107,700
Glasgow	3	£225,558	£75,186
Glasgow / Inverclyde / West Lothian / North Lanarkshire	1	£120,000	£120,000
Highland / Moray	1	£120,000	£120,000
Moray	1	£119,625	£119,625
North Lanarkshire	1	£66,823	£66,823
West Dunbartonshire	1	£40,012	£40,012
West Lothian	1	£116,000	£119,625
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>£1,393,384</b>	

Source: Creative Scotland (2020)



# **BOP** Consulting

BOP Consulting is an international consultancy specialising in culture and the creative economy.

BOP convenes the **World Cities Culture Forum** (WCCF), an international network of more than 35 cities. [www.worldcitiescultureforum.com](http://www.worldcitiescultureforum.com)

## **London**

Henry Wood House, 2 Riding House Street,  
London W1W 7FA

## **Edinburgh**

16 Young Street, Edinburgh, EH2 4JB

## **Shanghai**

213 – 214, No. 585 Fuxing Middle Road,  
Shanghai 200025, China

## **Web**

[www.bop.co.uk](http://www.bop.co.uk)

## **Twitter**

@BOP\_Consulting

## **Blog**

[www.bop.co.uk/articles](http://www.bop.co.uk/articles)