
Evaluation of the Youth Music Initiative

Creative Scotland

**Final Report
October 2014**



Contents

1. Introduction.....	1
2. YMI Programme Administration	4
3. YMI Funded Activities.....	12
4. Experiences of Delivering YMI Activity	27
5. Impact and Outcomes	39
6. Future Outcomes Measurement.....	51
7. Issues for Consideration.....	58

Appendices

Appendix One: YMI Formula Fund Leads Discussion Guide

Appendix Two: Informal Fund, Third Sector Organisations: Survey

1. Introduction

About this report

- 1.1 This report sets out findings from a retrospective evaluation of the Scottish Government Youth Music Initiative (YMI) programme. The YMI is administered by Creative Scotland, and aims to put music at the heart of young people's lives and learning. It was set up in 2003.
- 1.2 In 2014, Creative Scotland appointed us – ODS Consulting – to evaluate the YMI. The first stage of the evaluation was a retrospective evaluation, looking back over the past 11 years of the YMI's operation. This report focuses on findings from this retrospective evaluation.
- 1.3 The next stage of the evaluation involves a detailed focus on the YMI during 2014/15. This evaluation will run from September 2014 to July 2015.

Research Aims

- 1.4 The primary aim of this phase of the research was to explore the impact of the YMI programme to date – on young people; delivery organisations; practitioners and the youth music sector. Additional aims included:
 - to develop an understanding of programme strengths and weaknesses;
 - to report on the contribution the YMI makes towards Scottish Government national outcomes; Curriculum for Excellence; and local authority Single Outcome Agreements; and
 - to understand the measures and indicators that will be most effective in measuring the outcomes of the programme in future years.

Method

- 1.5 The retrospective evaluation involved a mix of primary and secondary research, and both quantitative and qualitative analysis. It involved four main stages:
 - **Desktop review** – We undertook a detailed review of the information Creative Scotland holds about the operation and impact of the YMI. We reviewed:
 - **Funding information** – We reviewed YMI budgets and overview sheets which recorded the funding allocated to each project, by year.
 - **Existing monitoring information** – Creative Scotland had already collated some monitoring information from project application forms and end of project forms. We reviewed this to gather information about activities and participants.
 - **Background and contextual information** – We reviewed Creative Scotland guidance on the YMI funding streams, and collated information about intended impacts and outcomes of the funds.

- **Profiling activity** – We gathered all available application forms and end of project forms for each of the projects funded through YMI, from 2010/11 to 2013/14. We created an Excel matrix, and recorded information from these forms – focusing on information about activity levels, participant numbers and profile, deliverer numbers and profile, and impact and outcomes. This provided an overview of the level and impact of YMI funded activity. However, it is important to note that there were some gaps in data. Where relevant, throughout this report we have highlighted the source of the data and how robust it is, so that this can be taken into account when interpreting the findings.
- **Telephone interviews** – We undertook telephone interviews with the lead officers for the YMI in each local authority area. Each local authority (and Jordanhill School) receives funding through the YMI ‘Formula Fund’ – which makes up 80 per cent of the YMI budget. The telephone discussions focused on how decisions are made about priorities for YMI funded activity; how these link with wider strategic objectives within the local authority; impact of YMI activity; focus on tackling inequalities in access to music; key successes and challenges; and views on current and future monitoring systems. We completed interviews with 31 of the 33 YMI Formula Fund leads. Two areas declined to participate as the YMI lead officer was very new in post. A copy of the discussion guide is attached as Appendix One.
- **Online survey** – We issued a survey to all third sector organisations which had received funding through the YMI Informal Fund route, from 2010/11 to 2013/14. The funding streams under this route have changed over the life of the YMI, but are currently Access to Music Making and Strengthening Youth Music. We identified 209 different organisations who had received this funding over this time period, for which there were current contact details. However, many of those who received funding through this route were small organisations or individuals, and contact details had changed or individuals had moved on, over the past four years. Overall, 187 organisations received the survey. We received 70 responses to the survey, from 68 different organisations. This is a response rate of 36 per cent. The survey focused on views around the aims of YMI funded activities; delivery; impact and monitoring. A copy of the survey is attached as Appendix Two. We also held telephone interviews with nine national organisations which had received funding through the YMI Informal Fund route over a number of years, identified by Creative Scotland. These explored the same issues as the survey, in more detail.

- 1.6 We gathered the qualitative and quantitative information together for analysis and built this into the report. We analysed the quantitative information using Excel. The qualitative information was analysed using a process of ‘manual thematic coding’. This involves carefully reading the information, highlighting key themes, and then collating and analysing all of the information about that theme together. This provides a systematic and robust approach to analysing rich, varied and complex qualitative information. We have also used verbatim

quotes from interviews and surveys to demonstrate key points. These have been anonymised.

Rational for research method

- 1.7 The retrospective evaluation was undertaken during late June, July and August 2014. This timescale was important, in order to inform the monitoring framework for the YMI for 2014/15. However, it meant that the fieldwork was undertaken over the summer holiday period. It was agreed that contact with young people would be very difficult over this period, with most YMI funded activities taking a break during this time. There is a strong focus on involving young people in the 2014/15 evaluation.
- 1.8 We worked to ensure that local authorities and third sector organisations could be involved in the research, but it should be noted that many individuals had very long holidays linked to the school summer holidays – meaning that it was challenging to encourage participation. We addressed this through extending timescales for fieldwork as far as was possible, including slightly beyond the summer school holiday period.
- 1.9 Due to the challenges undertaking primary fieldwork, the retrospective evaluation also draws strongly on the information already held about YMI funded activities through application forms and end of project forms. There is a wealth of rich information available through these forms, and we have carefully analysed these to identify key themes, issues and impacts.

Focus of the retrospective evaluation

- 1.10 While this evaluation looked back to 2003, its main focus was on the four years from 2010/11 to 2013/14. This was for three reasons:
 - in 2010, Creative Scotland took on responsibility for running the YMI (this previously lay with the Scottish Arts Council, which was merged with Scottish Screen to become Creative Scotland);
 - data on YMI funded projects (including application forms and end of project forms) was more readily available from 2010 onwards; and
 - four years was a reasonable period to ask participants to reflect on – although they were encouraged to think back over the full ten year period where possible.

2. YMI Programme Administration

Introduction

- 2.1 This chapter explores the administration of the YMI. It covers:
- the history of the programme;
 - an overview of the funding routes within the YMI;
 - the levels of application and funding allocations;
 - detail of how the programme is managed and monitored; and
 - views of funded projects in relation to the administration arrangements.

History

- 2.2 The YMI was set up in 2003 in response to ‘What’s Going On?’, a national audit of youth music published in 2003. This was commissioned jointly by the Scottish Arts Council, Youth Music UK and the Musicians Union. The audit estimated that:
- between 55,000 and 60,000 young people take part in music activities each week; and
 - 100,000 more young people would like to take part if they had the opportunity.
- 2.3 The audit found that fees for instrumental instruction and difficulties accessing musical instruments were key barriers to participation. The report recommended a review of local authority music and singing tuition, including assessing the costs and benefits of charging fees.
- 2.4 The report also identified priorities and gaps in provision including a need for support for:
- young people from minority ethnic communities and with additional support needs;
 - singing, music technology and creative music making;
 - the informal sector, as the infrastructure to support youth music making was highly fragmented.
- 2.5 On the basis of the report’s conclusions, the Scottish Government (then the Scottish Executive) pledged £17.5 million over three years to launch the Youth Music Initiative. An ambitious target was set for the YMI:
- “By 2006, all school children in Scotland should have access to one year’s free music tuition by the time they reach Primary 6.”¹
- 2.6 Overall, 80 per cent of the YMI funding was allocated for local authorities to improve youth music provision in schools, so that they could meet this target. This is known as the Formula Fund, as the money is allocated to each

¹ The Scottish Executive’s P6 Target: Report by the Scottish Arts Council, 2007

authority based on a formula. Jordanhill School also receives funding directly through this route, separately from Glasgow City Council.

- 2.7 The remaining 20 per cent of the funding was available to organisations in the voluntary and third sector, working out of school hours. Four of these organisations were considered to have national importance in the youth music sector, and were funded directly. These were:
- The National Youth Choir of Scotland;
 - The National Youth Orchestras of Scotland;
 - The National Youth Pipe Band; and
 - Feis Rois.
- 2.8 From 2004, organisations were also able to apply directly to the Informal Sector Fund.

Purpose and links

- 2.9 The YMI has three core aims:
- to create access to high quality music making opportunities – particularly for those who would not normally have the chance to participate;
 - to enable young people to achieve their potential in or through music making; and
 - to support the development of the youth music sector, for the benefit of young people.
- 2.10 The YMI is aimed at young people from birth through to 25 years. It is managed by Creative Scotland, a non departmental public body sponsored by the Scottish Government and Scottish Ministers. An important part of the remit of Creative Scotland is encouraging as many people as possible to access and participate in the arts and culture.
- 2.11 The YMI therefore links closely to Creative Scotland objectives, and other national priorities. An important part of Creative Scotland's vision relates to how young people interact with music, arts and creativity.

“Every young person will expect the arts and creativity to be part of their lives – through education, through friends, through social experiences and online.”
(Unlocking Potential, Embracing Ambition, 2014)

- 2.12 The YMI has clear potential links with Creative Scotland's ten year plan, and with Scottish Government's national outcomes. The clearest and most direct links are highlighted below.

Creative Scotland Ambitions	Scottish Government National Outcomes
Everyone can access and enjoy artistic and creative experiences	Our young people are successful learners, confident individuals, effective contributors and responsible citizens
Places and quality of life are transformed through imagination, ambition and an understanding of the potential of creativity	We have tackled the significant inequalities in Scottish society
Ideas are brought to life by a diverse, skilled and connected leadership and workforce	We take pride in a strong, fair and inclusive national identity

Funding routes

- 2.13 There are two main funding routes within the YMI: the Formula Fund and the Informal Sector Fund. Over the life of the YMI, the balance of funding has remained 80 per cent towards local authorities through the Formula Fund, and 20 per cent towards out of school activities through the Informal Sector Fund.

The Formula Fund

- 2.14 The purpose of the Formula Fund has remained broadly consistent. Its core purpose is to meet the Scottish Government P6 target that *“every school pupil in Scotland should be offered a year of free music tuition by the time they reach primary six”*.
- 2.15 The guidelines around the P6 target have changed slightly over time, but have retained common principles. Formula Fund activity is to consolidate and sustain the P6 target. The guidance states that pupils must receive a minimum of 12 hours of music tuition, and that where possible programmes should be sustained over a period of time throughout the academic year.
- 2.16 A secondary purpose of the Formula Fund was introduced in Year 11 of the Fund (2013/14), in response to calls from local authorities for increased guidance on the purpose of the YMI funds if the P6 target was already being met. It applies to any projects delivered which do not contribute to the P6 target, and is to *“engage young people (of any school age) who otherwise would not participate in quality music making activities.”* This secondary purpose was developed in consultation with a steering group involving local authority YMI leads. The guidance included a clear definition of young people who are more likely not to be taking part. The guidance stated that this could include, for example, young people who:
- are in the early years of their life (0 to 5);
 - are looked after by the local authority;
 - live in areas where music opportunities may be limited;
 - live in areas of social and economic deprivation;
 - are from minority ethnic communities; or
 - have additional support needs.

The Informal Sector Fund

- 2.17 Over time, the funding arrangements within the Informal Sector Fund have changed slightly.
- 2.18 Firstly, the number of organisations seen as having national importance and therefore being invited to receive funding from Creative Scotland has increased. These organisations are seen as having the ability to undertake targeted interventions that strategically address the aims of the programme. In 2014, there were nine organisations receiving funding through this route:
- Drake Music Scotland
 - Feis Rois
 - National Piping Centre/ National Youth Pipe Band
 - National Youth Choir of Scotland
 - National Youth Orchestras of Scotland
 - Scottish Book Trust
 - Scottish Brass Band Association
 - Scottish Music Centre
 - Sistema Scotland.
- 2.19 Secondly, the administration of some of the funding routes has changed over time. Creative Scotland previously administered funding for training and continuing professional development directly, receiving individual applications. From Year 9 (2011/12), it devolved funding to the Scottish Music Centre to administer and manage funding for continuing professional development and training for individuals, organisations and networks who work outwith school settings (or both outwith and within school settings).
- 2.20 Finally, the funding routes have been streamlined over time. The current funding routes, introduced in Year 10 (2012/13) are Access to Music Making and Strengthening Youth Music. Before 2012/13, there was a wider range of different funding routes. However, these funding routes have always had a focus on the two core aims of access to music making, and strengthening youth music.

Access to Music Making

- 2.21 The purpose of this fund is to create high quality music making opportunities for young people from birth to 25, out of school time. However, activities within school time are considered if they are for children in early years, young people with additional support needs, or young people who are disengaged from mainstream education. Priority is given to applicants who propose to take specific steps to engage with people who may face barriers to accessing music making, or support young people who are making music independently already.
- 2.22 The intended outcomes of this fund are that:
- young people engage in learning activities that develop music making skills or music centred skills (like engineering, tour management or record production);

- young people build their confidence, self esteem and positive behaviours; and
- young people progress onto further learning and/ or personal development opportunities (not restricted to music).

2.23 Organisations that previously received funding from the YMI must demonstrate how their activity will create new opportunities for young people not currently engaged to participate and enable the young people already involved to develop new skills.

Strengthening Youth Music

2.24 The purpose of this fund is to support individuals, organisations and networks to undertake strategic action or training that will strengthen the youth music sector in Scotland, for the benefit of young people. The intended outcomes of this fund are:

- provision of youth music services is more co-ordinated and designed in response to the needs of young people (both locally and nationally);
- the quality and standard of youth music provision improves; and
- there are new and innovative approaches to delivery that improve engagement in high quality music making activities for young people.

2.25 Again, Creative Scotland prioritises applicants who propose to take specific steps to engage with young people who may face barriers to accessing music making, or to support young people who are making music independently already.

Budgets

2.26 Information on the YMI budgets and funding allocations is available from 2010/11 to 2013/14 (Years 8 to 11 of the YMI).

Table 2.1: YMI Budgets, 2010/11 to 2013/14				
Year	Formula Fund	Access to Music Making ²	Strengthening Youth Music ³	Total
Year 8 (2010/11)	£8,012,820	£1,400,000	£330,180	£9,743,000
Year 9 (2011/12)	£8,012,820	£1,030,000	£157,180	£9,200,000*
Year 10 (2012/13)	£8,012,820	£1,587,180	£200,000	£9,800,000**
Year 11 (2013/14)	£8,012,820	£1,587,180	£200,000	£9,800,000***

*In Year 9 £180,000 was also set aside for contingency projects

**In Year 10, £200,000 was set aside for overhead recovery

***In Year 11, £200,000 was set aside for overhead recovery

2.27 The budget for the Formula Fund has remained static for the past four years. The budgets for Access to Music Making and Strengthening Youth Music have fluctuated. Overall, the budget for Access to Music Making has increased

² In Years 8 and 9, Access to Music Making includes a range of funding streams including Access and Excellence, Early Years, Small Grants, Large Grants, Independent Music Making and Contingency Projects.

³ In Years 8 and 9, Strengthening Youth Music includes a range of funding streams including Youth Music Forums, Strategic Music Partnerships and Training and CPD

slightly, while the budget for Strengthening Youth Music has decreased by over a third (39%).

- 2.28 Overall each year, the YMI budget has been fully allocated. However, the level of allocation varies across different funding streams.

Table 2.2: YMI Funding Allocations, 2010/11 to 2013/14				
Year	Formula Fund	Access to Music Making	Strengthening Youth Music	Total
Year 8 (2010/11)	100%	98%	117%	100%
Year 9 (2011/12)	100%	164%	80%	97%
Year 10 (2012/13)	100%	82%	79%	93%
Year 11 (2013/14)	100%	111%	36%	101%

Applications

- 2.29 All organisations seeking Formula Funds and Informal Sector Funds must complete an application form. Creative Scotland has a YMI Programme team which encourages, supports and assesses applications. The team provides support in person (through surgeries), by phone, by email and through guidance.
- 2.30 Each year, all organisations entitled to the Formula Fund have applied for and received funding. However, the level of applications to the Access to Music Making and Strengthening Youth Music funds has varied. The number of applications received each year is provided in Table 2.3 below. It is important to note that in Year 10 (2012/13), Creative Scotland asked the Scottish Music Centre to administer the continuing professional development and training aspect of strengthening youth music. This is why there is a significant drop in the number of strengthening youth music applications, as from Year 10 onwards these were covered in one single application from Scottish Music Centre.

Table 2.3: Number of Applications, 2010/11 to 2013/14			
Year	Access to Music Making Applications	Strengthening Youth Music Applications	Total
Year 8 (2010/11)*	121+	55+	176+
Year 9 (2011/12)	109	156	265
Year 10 (2012/13)	83	13	96
Year 11 (2013/14)	116	7	123

*The data for year 8 unsuccessful applicants is incomplete.

- 2.31 The balance between successful and unsuccessful applications also varied each year. Broadly, the proportion of successful applicants decreased across both funding streams between Year 8 and Year 11.

Table 2.4: Successful and Unsuccessful Applications, 2010 to 2014						
Year	Access to Music Making Applications			Strengthening Youth Music Applications		
	Successful	Rejected	% Accepted	Success	Rejected	% Accepted
Year 8 (10/11)*	74	47+	62% or less	46	9	84%
Year 9 (11/12)	74	35	68%	11**	3	79%
Year 10 (12/13)	57	26	69%	10	3	77%
Year 11 (13/14)	51	49	59%	3	2	60%

*The data for year 8 unsuccessful applicants is incomplete.

**In Year 9, 7 of these SYM applications were funded from the 2012/13 budget

***In Year 11, 2 more SYM and 16 more AMM applications were considered for the 2014/15 budget

Monitoring

- 2.32 Successful applicants to the YMI are required to provide monitoring and evaluation information. When organisations apply, they are required to provide information about:
- intended activities and number and profile of participants;
 - number of staff, trainees and volunteers to be involved in the project;
 - details of any proposed partnership working;
 - intended outcomes of the project; and
 - the management, monitoring and evaluation arrangements which are in place.
- 2.33 Where resources allow, the YMI team records this information in an Excel matrix. This is used to inform annual reporting.
- 2.34 When organisations complete their funded activity, they are required to complete the standard Creative Scotland End of Project Form. This gathers information on:
- how the activity has benefited the public, the funded organisation or individual, and the sector;
 - the likely long term benefits of the project;
 - the number of people who benefited from the activity;
 - the number of jobs created and volunteers involved; and
 - other feedback and wider information such as quotes from participants, publications or photographs.
- 2.35 The End of Project Forms can be used to assess organisational achievements against original objectives. However, they are not analysed collectively to provide overview information about the programme impact and outcomes.

Summary

- 2.36 The YMI was set up in 2003, in response to an audit which identified that 100,000 more young people would like to take part in music activities, if they had the opportunity. It had a core target of ensuring that by 2006, all school pupils in Scotland had access to one year's free music tuition by the time they reached Primary 6. The YMI links closely to Creative Scotland objectives, and other national priorities – through supporting young people to develop skills, build confidence, explore their national identity through music, and tackling inequalities in access to music.
- 2.37 The annual budget of the YMI is £10 million. Eighty per cent of the YMI funding is allocated to local authorities to improve youth music provision in schools. This is known as the Formula Fund. The remaining 20 per cent is the Informal Sector Fund which is available to third sector and voluntary organisations, working out of school hours. There are two broad strands to this funding – Access to Music Making, and Strengthening Youth Music. Access to Music Making generally makes up around 90 per cent of the Informal Sector Fund, with Strengthening Youth Music approximately 11 per cent.
- 2.38 Much of the Strengthening Youth Music Fund involves training and continuing professional development support. From 2012/13 onwards, Creative Scotland devolved funding through a single award to Scottish Music Centre, who now administer this element of the fund. Demand is high for the Access to Music Making Fund, with between 30 and 40 per cent of applications to this fund being rejected.
- 2.39 Successful applicants to the YMI are required to provide monitoring and evaluation information through a Creative Scotland End of Project Form. While this information can be used to assess organisational achievements against original objectives, it is not currently analysed collectively to provide overview information about programme impact and outcomes.

3. YMI Funded Activities

Introduction

- 3.1 This chapter explores the nature of YMI funded activities. It sets out the number and type of organisations funded through YMI and the nature of activities funded. It also looks at the number of young people involved in funded activities and the organisations and people which deliver them.

Number of organisations involved

- 3.2 Overall, between 2010/11 and 2013/14:
- 33 organisations received funding each year through the Formula Fund;
 - 256 projects were funded through Access to Music Making;
 - Creative Scotland made 70 funding awards through Strengthening Youth Music; and
 - from 2012/13 onwards, one of the Strengthening Youth Music awards (to Scottish Music Centre) resulted in multiple further awards for training and continuing professional development, administered by the Scottish Music Centre.
- 3.3 There is significant overlap in the organisations funded. Some received more than one funding award within the one year (either through the same funding stream or from different YMI funding streams) and some received funding a number of years in a row.
- 3.4 Analysis of the data from 2010/11 to 2013/14 shows that more than a third of the funded organisations in Access to Music Making received more than one award, compared to just a fifth of those within Strengthening Youth Music.

Table 3.1: Awards to the Informal Sector Fund, 2010 to 2014			
	Access to Music Making	Strengthening Youth Music	Total
1 award	104	45	149
2 awards	32	8	40
3 awards	17	3	20
4 awards	8	-	8
5 awards	1	-	1
Total organisations	162	56	218
Total awards	256	70	326
% more than one award	36%	20%	32%

- 3.5 There was also overlap in funding between different streams. Between 2010/11 and 2013/14, 12 organisations received funding from both the Access to Music Making and Strengthening Youth Music funds.

- 3.6 Finally, some local authorities received funding through the Informal Sector Fund. Creative Scotland agreed that local authorities could apply for funding through this route if it was for a project which would run out of school, and was not led by the team leading on the YMI Formula Fund within the local authority. Between 2010/11 and 2013/14, 13 local authorities received funding through the Informal Sector Fund.

Type of activity funded

The Formula Fund

- 3.7 The Formula Fund was primarily used to support delivery of the P6 target, that all young people should receive an offer of a year's free musical tuition by primary six. In Year 8 and Year 9, the Formula Fund enabled over 270 projects, of which at least 59 per cent contributed to the P6 target. It should be noted that a small number of areas did not identify how many projects contributed to the P6 target, in their application form.

Table 3.2: Formula Funded Projects, 2010 to 2014			
	Number of funded projects	Contributing to P6 target?	
		Number	%
Year 8	271	160+*	59% or more
Year 9	272	161+	59% or more
Year 10	284	228	80%

*6 of the 33 Formula Fund recipients left this section blank in Year 8 and 5 in Year 9

- 3.8 The way in which this funding was used to achieve the P6 target, however, varied. Some local authorities took a very targeted approach, for example focusing on one age group (often P3 or P5) and making sure that everyone in that age group had access to a programme of music making. Some focused on a particular instrument – for example making sure that all P5s had the opportunity to learn the recorder. Others ensured that there were a range of opportunities available, from early years to P6 and beyond. The type of activity funded included:
- **delivery of instrumental tuition** – across a range of musical styles, including classical, traditional, jazz, rock and pop; and a range of instruments including recorder, bagpipes, African drums, fiddle, brass, woodwind and voice;
 - **Kodaly programmes** – many local authorities were using this method of musical and vocal instruction, which uses rhythm, movement and hand signs together;
 - **supporting group activity** - including choral workshops and instrumental ensembles;
 - **activity to build music technology skills** - including IT, software, recording and DJing skills;
 - **activity to build writing and creative composition skills;**
 - **bespoke music programmes for vulnerable young people** – including use of the 'skoog' (an accessible music instrument); participation in Drake Music activities (a national organisation supporting accessible music for children and young people with

additional support needs) and music therapy (often working with Nordoff Robbins, a specialist organisation in this field);

- **inter-disciplinary projects** – for example, including dancing and music through focusing on a time period (e.g. music of the 1920s) or an artistic style (e.g. Bollywood); and
- **continuing professional development activity for teachers** – to build skills in key areas including Kodaly, Figurenotes (software for young people with additional support needs), Dalcroze (music and body movement) and Soundbeam (which translates body movement into sound), and also including training and development of resource packs for non-specialist teachers.

3.9 Many local authorities highlighted that they worked in partnership with other organisations and local artists to deliver YMI activity. The successes and lessons learned from YMI delivery are explored further in Chapter Four.

Access to Music Making

3.10 With over 250 awards relating to Access to Music Making over 2010/11 to 2013/14, the activities funded were many and varied. The types of activity funded included:

- **recording and performance opportunities** – largely focusing on first time recording, demo and live performances for individuals and young bands;
- **musical tuition and mentoring** – including projects focused on Gaelic music, piping, jazz, singing and music making;
- **community based music workshops** – including singing, playing instruments, acting and performing (for example through holding workshops or developing youth street bands);
- **developing skills in music production** – with opportunities both for people already interested in music, and for those not already involved (including youth radio and podcast production);
- **developing skills in music organisation** – including opportunities to lead and organise on local events and concerts;
- **rehearsal and recording space** – providing safe and accessible spaces for rehearsing and recording;
- **supporting live performances** – including supporting young people to go on their first live tours; and
- **summer and weekend music opportunities** – some for children and young people of mixed musical abilities, and others for people already making music, focusing on rehearsal and recording.

Example: Supporting early years

Fun Folk, run by Feis Rois, received funding from the YMI. It aims to support the transition from nursery to primary school for young people using traditional music. Scottish Book Trust also received £100,000 from the YMI to expand the reach of its BookBug activities for very young children, from birth. The funding supported the development of new resources, training, support and mentoring for BookBug Session Leaders across Scotland.

Example: Access to music performance

Music for Youth received £100,000 to provide opportunities for young musicians to develop their musical talents. It provides access to skills development workshops, expert advice from professional musicians, and supports young people to take part in high quality performance opportunities.

- 3.11 Many of the activities funded through Access to Music Making were specifically targeted at young people who may be less likely to be involved in music making. Many activities focused on opportunities for young people living in disadvantaged areas; young people who were not in employment, education or training; young people who face barriers and issues in their lives; and young people with additional support needs. A small number of activities focused on opportunities for people from minority ethnic communities. And some opportunities focused strongly on bringing together vulnerable people with others, to share experiences and skills.

Example: Supporting vulnerable young people

The Prince's Trust received funding to run a personal development programme to help marginalised and excluded young people who face a range of issues and barriers in life. This programme used music as its hook to get young people involved and interested in their personal development and life skills.

Example: Bringing young people together

Space Unlimited received £25,000 to work with 30 young people – half of whom have additional support needs. Together, the young people were supported to engage in creative music making, culminating in a musical performance.

Strengthening Youth Music

- 3.12 Strengthening Youth Music funding awards were made for a range of purposes, including:
- **Continuing professional development and training** – Individuals received funding for attending training events, study trips, conferences, summer schools and working towards qualifications. Funding was also used to build professional pathways and CPD programmes within organisations. Many of the awards related to building skills around Kodaly. Very few funds were for developing skills around working with vulnerable young people (although there are gaps in the information available).
 - **Supporting youth music forums** – Including funding to explore feasibility and enable establishment of new youth music forums. Funds were also used to strengthen existing forums, to assist with promotion and inclusion, and to enable training and continuing professional development for support staff. Most forums were regional.
 - **Supporting sharing of skills and experience** – A small number of organisations received funding to help run conferences to share skills and experiences or to undertake research into youth music, its successes and challenges.

Example: Developing youth music forums

Edinburgh Youth Music Forum received funding in Year 8 and Year 10 of the YMI, to embed the Forum as the hub for stimulating opportunities to improve the quality and standard of youth music provision in Edinburgh. It received funding to support communications, awareness raising, education and branding.

Example: Supporting national events

Enterprise Music Scotland received £17,000 towards running its conference for all music education practitioners across Scotland. This involved instrumental instructors, performers, promoters and collaborators working in primary, secondary and additional support needs schools.

Strategic links and decision making

Formula Fund – decision making and consultation

- 3.13 Creative Scotland's guidelines on use of the Formula Fund highlight three priorities:
- delivery of training and continuing professional development for YMI instructors and other stakeholders (like class teachers and assistants) that will help sustain music making;
 - consultation with young people so their choices can be taken into account, and if appropriate with local authority staff and external stakeholders in planning the YMI programme; and
 - development of partnerships with providers and stakeholders outwith the local authority.
- 3.14 As part of this research, recipients of the Formula Fund were asked, in detail, how they prioritised the activities they undertook through the YMI, and how these linked with local and national strategic priorities. Firstly, we explored where responsibility for the YMI sat within the local authority. In almost all cases, the YMI sat within Education Services, or directorates that covered a mix of education, children and families, culture or leisure services. Some respondents commented that in recent years, the management of YMI had been in a state of flux, with responsibility for the YMI programme changing as a result of organisational change and internal restructures.
- 3.15 One respondent said that YMI used to be part of Education, but was now run by a Trust on behalf of the council. Another respondent highlighted that despite having just been through a period of significant organisational review and change, it was likely that responsibility for YMI would be moving to a Trust, as part of the next stage of reorganisation of the council's services.
- 3.16 Approximately a third of Formula Fund leads said that their priorities for YMI were 'historical' and had not changed much over the years. In particular, some of the newer YMI lead contacts said that priorities had been set by their predecessors and had remained pretty much unchanged since then. One highlighted that the funding had been used to fill gaps in existing provision,

particularly in rural areas, and that this approach had continued since the outset.

“What we’ve got in place works.”

(Formula Fund lead)

- 3.17 Four Formula Fund leads said that they had sole responsibility for setting YMI priorities in their area. In contrast, others said that priorities had been developed as a result of wider consultation - for example with teachers and colleagues from other services, senior management teams, the wider community. In some instances this also included service users and deliverers. Some Formula Fund leads said that they had established Steering Groups or Working Groups to review and develop the YMI programme in their local authority area.

Example: Consultation

In Glasgow, the YMI lead talks with young people and teachers to identify gaps in music provision. Through this type of consultation they were able to set up tailored initiatives and projects, for example, they started a Jazz Big Band.

Example: Consultation and Review Approaches

When the YMI was launched in 2003, Perth and Kinross Council organised a series of community consultations and reference groups comprising local councillors, parents, pupils and teachers and other partners to generate ideas and help inform how the YMI should be allocated. Priorities are now informed by a combination of annual project evaluations and regular stakeholder feedback that is gathered throughout the year.

- 3.18 Almost half of Formula Fund leads interviewed said that they undertook stakeholder consultation to inform the future design and development of their YMI programmes. Consultation took a number of different forms, including:
- gathering feedback directly from participants;
 - meetings with Pupil and Parent Councils;
 - informal classroom discussions about YMI activities;
 - regular meetings with colleagues;
 - through staff working groups and partner steering groups; and
 - formal programme evaluations.

- 3.19 There was agreement that gathering feedback helped to ensure that programmes were relevant and fit for purpose.

“It has led to changes, in that it has raised the quality of delivery rather than things becoming stale.”

(Formula Fund lead)

“It allows us to have frank discussions with our colleagues, which are evidence based.”

(Formula Fund lead)

Example: Influencing YMI projects

In Dundee, a Parental Development Officer works with Parent Councils to inform the future design and delivery of the Aspire programme. Feedback is gathered from young people, through a city wide Pupil Council and also from participants after workshops - using a mix of informal discussions and formal evaluation forms.

Formula Fund – priorities and strategic links

- 3.20 Many respondents said that their priorities were now closely aligned to council priorities, Creative Scotland's aims for YMI, and other national programmes and priorities – particularly the Curriculum for Excellence.

"Everything we do is aligned with Curriculum for Excellence."

(Formula Fund lead)

Example: Alignment with Curriculum for Excellence

In West Lothian, the YMI lead develops a plan for each YMI funded project. This highlights the aims and outcomes of the projects and also shows how these align to Curriculum for Excellence outcomes. Schools and teachers like this approach, as it shows them how projects can fit into their curriculum and schedule.

- 3.21 Some said that YMI projects had helped to promote inter-disciplinary working in schools, and also helped teachers to see the relevance of YMI activities for pupils. One respondent said that without YMI, they would have struggled to do anything around youth music in schools and that it had definitely enabled the development of curricular opportunities.

Example: Inter-Disciplinary Learning

In Shetland, the YMI has supported an African drumming class that is offered in schools – it is linked to a whole topic on Africa where pupils look at food, culture and celebrations.

- 3.22 Links between the YMI Formula Fund and community planning were weak in many areas. However, a number of respondents said that their YMI activities and programmes were linked into local Single Outcome Agreements, either through their service plans or through wider partnership working. These individuals were able to connect YMI activity to wider outcomes.

"Although the Single Outcome Agreement is a high level document, our service plan is the golden thread."

(Formula Fund lead)

- 3.23 One Formula Fund lead commented that YMI funding had helped to provide a 'voice' within their council's community planning process, as it meant that they were able to engage with education colleagues and had opportunities to influence decision making. Another said that their YMI project had helped to promote more joined up working and collaboration between services.

Example: Three Year Planning Cycle

North Lanarkshire Council has a three-year planning cycle for the YMI. As part of this they undertake consultation about YMI and other related council initiatives. YMI consultation involves young people, stakeholders, parents, community organisations and agencies, and teachers. This consultation aims to identify gaps in provision and areas, which will attract young people. This happens every year of the planning cycle.

Formula Fund – changing aims

- 3.24 When asked whether they thought the aims of the YMI funded activity had changed over the past four years, views from Formula Fund leads were split. Approximately half felt that the aims hadn't changed significantly in recent years.

“The aim is to meet the P6 target and this hasn't changed – but it has helped to raise the profile of music in P6s – and not just in the instructors, but through CPD (continuing professional development).”

(Formula Fund lead)

- 3.25 However, some felt that the approach had changed to be more inclusive, ensuring opportunities were made available to all children and young people. Others said that there had been greater flexibility to allow the aims to fit with changing national policies and priorities, including early years and tackling inequalities.

“It is about the non engaged.”

(Formula Fund lead)

- 3.26 Six Formula Fund leads said that there had been a change in emphasis when Creative Scotland took over from the Scottish Arts Council, but that things had settled down over the last few years. Four respondents commented that Creative Scotland often *“moved the goalposts”* and that more was being expected of councils in terms of the delivery of YMI, without any increase in funding.

Informal Sector Fund

- 3.27 Generally, recipients of the Informal Sector Fund felt that there was a very good fit between the aims of their organisation, and the aims of the YMI. Overall, 99 per cent of recipients completing the survey felt that this was the case.

“Oh yes! We want to get people singing as much as possible, so its spot on.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- 3.28 When explaining why, most respondents emphasised how their organisation contributed to intended YMI outcomes, including:

- **Access to opportunities** - Many said that their projects had helped to provide opportunities for young people across Scotland to develop and

realise their musical talents, particularly within remote rural and island communities and in disadvantaged communities across Scotland. Some said that without funding support from YMI, many young people would not have been able to access such opportunities. Some organisations also commented positively on the opportunities that had been created for young people with disabilities, and also young people from different cultures and ethnic backgrounds.

“We work with disadvantaged young people to break down their barriers, build their confidence, increase their motivation, and improve their employability - and music is a fantastic way to help disengaged young people reconnect with personal development and education.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- **Improved confidence and learning** - A number of recipients highlighted the positive benefits for young people of participating in YMI funded projects saying that it had helped them to become more confident and to increase their self esteem. A few respondents also said that it had created a ‘positive learning platform’ for young people, exposing them to new experiences and positive alternatives.
- **Nurturing and growing talent** - Some respondents said that funding from YMI had been key to enabling some young musicians to make their own recordings and release their own music. In many cases this would not have been affordable for many young musicians. Others said that in addition to providing opportunities for young people to develop their musical creativity, it also provided opportunities to develop technical recording skills and media marketing skills. A small number of respondents said that it had helped to promote live music and ‘youth banding’ in local areas.

“YMI has enabled young people across West Lothian to work alongside skilled music, song and sound design practitioners, to build confidence, social creative and technical skills.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

Example: Opportunities in Rural Areas

The Access All Areas music project offers young people living in rural isolation in Dumfries and Galloway the opportunity to learn, collaborate, and produce their own music. It offers writing workshops, rehearsal facilities with equipment, a full recording suite, excursions to professional studios, and advice from industry professionals.

Example: Inclusive Approaches

Paragon delivers high quality inclusive music making opportunities for young people with additional support needs through its Play On programme. Through this we are able to develop musical skills and performance opportunities for students in Glasgow and Edinburgh and plan to extend the programme further afield to other parts of Scotland.

YMI outputs

- 3.29 The focus of this evaluation is on the outcomes of YMI funding, exploring the difference that this funding has made to young people and wider communities in Scotland. However, it is important to understand the scale of this difference in terms of the number of activities that have taken place, the number of young participants in funded activity and the number of people involved in delivery of YMI funded activity.
- 3.30 As part of this research, we collated information End of Project Forms from 2010/11 to 2013/14. We summarised the number of specific activities that took place and the number of young people and deliverers involved. It is important to note that End of Project Forms were not available for some funding allocations. For Year 10, some projects were still ongoing or very recently completed at the time of this evaluation, and therefore had not submitted End of Project Forms.
- 3.31 As Year 11 (2013/14) of the YMI had only just completed as we began this evaluation, there were very few End of Project Forms available for this year – as they were still being completed. We have therefore excluded Year 11 (2013/14) from this analysis.

Number of activities

- 3.32 The End of Project Forms ask for information about the number and type of activities undertaken. These forms are not available for all organisations, therefore the figures below need to be treated with caution. It is important to note the final row in the table which highlights the proportion of End of Project Forms that were available for each fund.

Table 3.3: Activities Supported through the YMI, 2010/11 to 2012/13												
Activities	Year 8 (2010/11)			Year 9 (2011/12)			Year 10 (2012/13)			Total		
	FF	AMM	SYM	FF	AMM	SYM	FF	AMM	SYM	FF	AMM	SYM
Music sessions	1,275	14,785	36	556	14,959	14	247	17,176	0	2,078	46,920	50
School workshops	3,119	380	42	3,723	726	16	3,111	695	0	9,953	1,801	58
Exhibitions	0	3	0	1	14	4	1	0	0	2	17	4
Total activities	4,394	15,168	78	4,280	15,699	34	3,359	17,871	0	12,033	48,738	112
% End of Project Form available	70%	55%	52%	79%	72%	27%	45%	26%	-	65%	53%	40%

3.33 Overall, the figures show that over three years, the YMI supported:

- at least 49,048 participatory music sessions;
- at least 11,812 school workshops; and
- at least 23 exhibitions.

3.34 It is very important to note that the number of music sessions within Access to Music Making is very highly dominated by BookBug sessions. There were approximately 14,000 BookBug sessions each year in Years 8 and 9, rising to over 17,000 in Year 10. The YMI funding provides training for BookBug deliverers, but this funding is complemented by funding from other sources (including local authorities) which supports delivery. The YMI funding therefore contributes to enabling these music sessions, and enhancing their quality, but does not entirely fund them.

3.35 The figures show a reasonably high level of 'school workshop' activity within the Informal Sector Funds. These are largely targeted at young people who are disadvantaged, have additional support needs, or are disengaged from education. The Informal Sector Fund guidance makes clear that funds can be used in this way to support disadvantaged young people in a school environment.

3.36 The figures above are based on a proportion of End of Project Forms being available. These figures can be very broadly extrapolated, to provide an indication of likely overall figures. However, it is important to treat these with caution, as every YMI funded project is very different. For the purposes of extrapolating the Access to Music Making figures, BookBug activities have been excluded, given the huge difference in scale of this activity compared with all others. Figures have been rounded to provide broad estimates, rather than precise figures. Year 10 figures have not been extrapolated, as many End of Project Forms have not yet been received due to ongoing work on projects and evaluation.

Table 3.4: Very Broad Estimate of Activity across all YMI Funded Projects, 2010/11 and 2011/12						
Activities	Year 8 (2010/11)			Year 9 (2011/12)		
	FF	AMM	SYM	FF	AMM	SYM
Music sessions	~1,800	~15,400	~70	~700	~15,200	~50
School workshops	~4,500	~690	~80	~4,700	~1,000	~60
Exhibitions	0	~5	0	~1	~20	~15
Total activities	~6,300	~16,100	~150	~5,400	~16,200	~125

3.37 These figures suggest that each year the YMI is supporting:

- around 16,000 to 17,000 music sessions;
- around 5,000 to 6,000 school workshops; and
- around 5 to 35 exhibitions.

Number of young people involved

3.38 The End of Project Forms also gather information on the number of attendances at certain activities – the performances and exhibitions – as well as an estimate of total participants. However, the guidance on attendances and participants within the End of Project Form is slightly confusing. Organisations are asked for the number of attendances at public performances and exhibitions, but not for education and outreach activity. Organisations are asked for an overall total number of participants, but it is not clear whether this only includes education and outreach activity, or if it also includes public performances and exhibitions. Organisations have therefore interpreted this in different ways.

3.39 In addition, the question about the total number of participants asks organisations to refer to a note which provides guidance on the number of attendances. This specifies that attendances should be counted in ‘attendance days’. This means that the same attendee should be counted multiple times if attending for more than a day, and should be counted as only a fraction of a day if attending for an hour’s session. This note is complicated and difficult for people to interpret. However, as this note on attendances is referred to from the section on total number of participants, it adds further confusion as to how attendances and participants should be counted. We therefore advise that the numbers below are treated with significant caution.

- 3.40 The figures suggest that there were almost 675,000 'attendance days' at music sessions between 2010/11 and 2012/13, and 853 attendances at exhibitions. The End of Project Forms suggest that there were a total of 1.7million young participants over these three years. With slightly more than 383,000 pupils in primary schools in Scotland in 2014, it is clear that there is double counting even within the Formula Fund figures, where it should be reasonably easy to track numbers on a school based setting. The figures for Years 8 and 9 for all funding streams appear much more realistic. It is likely that in Year 10, Formula Fund leads reported participants' 'attendance days' rather than distinct participants, in line with the guidance issued.

Table 3.5: Attendances and Participants in YMI Supported Activities, 2010/11 to 2012/13												
Attendances	Year 8 (2010/11)			Year 9 (2011/12)			Year 10 (2012/13)			Total		
	FF	AMM	SYM	FF	AMM	SYM	FF	AMM	SYM	FF	AMM	SYM
Music session 'attendance days'	38,422	47,036	1,428	95,392	445,977	694	38,137	7,770	-	171,951	50,0783	2,122
Exhibition 'attendance days'	0	165	0	50	366	72	200	-	-	250	531	72
Total participants	208,370	28,319	2,384	389,686	31,321	-	1,045,416	9,316	-	1,643,472	68,956	2,384
% End of Project Form available	70%	55%	52%	79%	72%	27%	45%	26%	-	65%	53%	40%

- 3.41 Due to the weaknesses in these figures, it is not particularly meaningful to extrapolate these to estimate the total number of participants (allowing for the gaps in End of Project Forms). However, data for Year 8 appears more robust with less double counting. Extrapolating these figures for Formula Fund would suggest that approximately 297,000 young people took part in Year 8. This compares with approximately 255,000 young people taking part in Formula Fund activity in Year 5⁴.

⁴ Scottish Arts Council Report on the P6 Target Data, Year 5 (2007/08), 2010

Number of staff and volunteers

3.42 Finally, the End of Project Forms gather information on how many posts were created as a result of the YMI activity, and how many volunteers were involved. This shows that across all funds, the YMI created approximately 142 full time jobs and 833 part time jobs over three years (although the same posts may be counted across different years). Approximately 87 per cent of the jobs were temporary.

Table 3.6: Posts Created through YMI Activity, 2010/11 to 2012/13												
Type of post	Year 8 (2010/11)			Year 9 (2011/12)			Year 10 (2012/13)			Total		
	FF	AMM	SYM	FF	AMM	SYM	FF	AMM	SYM	FF	AMM	SYM
Full time jobs	37	12	-	48	19	-	26	-	-	111	31	0
Part time jobs	211	71	3	231	117	1	188	15	-	630	203	4
Permanent jobs	45	1	-	30	64	-	7	52	-	82	117	0
Temporary jobs	242	199	21	338	190	-	200	114	-	780	503	21
Volunteers	22	338	21	54	498	33	34	114	-	110	950	54
% End of Project Form available	70%	55%	52%	79%	72%	27%	45%	26%	-	65%	53%	40%

Note: The figures for full time/ part time and permanent/ temporary do not add up, due to the way organisations have completed the forms.

- 3.43 The figures suggest that if all End of Project forms were available, the YMI may have created approximately:
- 50 to 60 full time jobs and around 300 part time jobs each year (with some overlap) through the Formula Fund;
 - around 25 full time jobs and around 130 to 160 part time jobs each year (with some overlap) through Access to Music Making; and
 - a small number of part time jobs through Strengthening Youth Music.
- 3.44 Scottish Arts Council analysis of jobs created in Year Five through the Formula Fund suggested that 586 individuals were employed to deliver Formula Fund activities in this year of the YMI. This was the equivalent of 195 full time staff members. This compares with around 360 individuals in Years 8 and 9. The full time equivalent is not known.

Summary

- 3.45 Overall, between 2010/11 and 2013/14 there were 326 funding awards to 218 organisations through the YMI. The Formula Fund awards to 32 local authorities (and Jordanhill School) were primarily used to support delivery of the P6 target, that all young people should receive an offer of a year's free musical tuition by primary six. Between 59 and 77 per cent of projects funded by the Formula Fund contributed to this target. The way in which this funding was used to achieve the P6 target varied.
- 3.46 Responsibility for the Formula Fund largely sat within education services, or directorates that covered a mix of education, children and families, culture or leisure services. Most Formula Fund leads said that their priorities for YMI were 'historical' and had not changed much over the years. However, others felt that there had been a shift towards contributing to national policies and priorities and taking a more inclusive approach.
- 3.47 Many Formula Fund leads said that their priorities were now closely aligned to council priorities, Creative Scotland's aims for the YMI, and other national programmes and priorities – particularly the Curriculum for Excellence. Links between the YMI Formula Fund and community planning were present in some cases, but were weak in many areas. A minority said that their approach to using YMI funding was a bit ad hoc.
- 3.48 There were over 250 awards relating to Access to Music Making. Many of the activities funded through Access to Music Making were specifically targeted at young people who may be less likely to be involved in music making, including young people living in disadvantaged areas, young people who were not in employment, education or training, young people who face barriers and issues in their lives and young people with additional support needs. Only a small number of activities focused specifically on opportunities for people from minority ethnic communities.
- 3.49 Strengthening Youth Music funding was used for continuing professional development and training; supporting the sharing of skills and experience; and supporting youth music forums. Generally, recipients of the Informal Sector Fund felt that there was a very good fit between the aims of their organisation and the aims of the YMI – through providing access to opportunities, improving confidence and learning, and nurturing and growing talent.
- 3.50 Overall, monitoring figures for 2010/11 to 2012/13 show that the YMI supported at least 49,000 participatory music sessions; at least 11,800 school workshops; and at least 23 exhibitions over three years.
- 3.51 Information on the discrete number of young participants in YMI funded activity does not appear to be robust. However, there were almost 675,000 attendances at music sessions between 2010/11 and 2012/13 and 853 attendances at exhibitions. Across all funds, the YMI created approximately 142 full time jobs and 833 part time jobs over these three years. Approximately 87 per cent of the jobs were temporary.

4. Experiences of Delivering YMI Activity

Introduction

- 4.1 This chapter explores experiences of delivering YMI funded activity. It particularly investigates:
- key successes;
 - approaches to targeting disadvantaged groups;
 - the extent and impact of partnership working;
 - views on the application and administration process around YMI funding; and
 - lessons which have been learned from the initiative so far.

Key successes

- 4.2 We explored key successes with lead contacts for both Formula Fund and Informal Sector Fund activities. We asked funding recipients to look back over the past four years in particular, but over longer if relevant, and to consider which approaches were particularly successful and why.

Formula Fund

- 4.3 Formula Fund leads were asked to highlight examples of aspects of their work that had been particularly effective in working towards the target of offering every school pupil a year of free music tuition by the time they reach P6. The key themes emerging are discussed below. Some Formula Fund leads also highlighted partnership working as a success, and this is covered in more detail later in this chapter.

Formula Fund - early intervention

- 4.4 A number of Formula Fund leads commented positively on the fact that the YMI programme had successfully increased the number of young people that could participate in music related projects and activities. Many said that rather than focusing exclusively on P6 pupils, they had targeted a range of age groups within primary schools, often P3 to P6 age children, and sometimes including pre-school children. These respondents felt that this was a more inclusive approach and delivered the best results as it allowed them to 'catch them early'.

"The main thing was not to cram it all into one year, but to spread it across every year and every school from Pre School to P6."

(Formula Fund lead)

"We are trying to develop a joined up way of working from early years right through."

(Formula Fund lead)

Formula Fund - benefits of flexibility

- 4.5 Many Formula Fund leads welcomed the flexibility that they had to develop their local YMI programmes. This was identified as a key success factor, as it allowed YMI leads to have 'creative freedom' to tailor projects and activities to suit local circumstances. This meant that the choice of activities on offer was many and varied, ranging from samba drumming, guitar and ukulele instruction to different forms of traditional and classical music.

"The flexibility of our projects is a very positive thing."

(Formula Fund lead)

- 4.6 In particular, some said that being able to offer singing and physical activity (like dance) had been very successful, as this was less reliant on specialist resources. It was also seen as being more inclusive, as it reached a wider target audience.

Example: Dialect Singing

Singing is an important part of the YMI programme in Shetland – and they have introduced dialect singing with music professionals. This has worked particularly well with P6 children, as they are 'game' for singing. The fact that there is no need for specialist equipment has been a bonus.

Formula Fund - access to specialists and skills development

- 4.7 A number of respondents said that having access to music specialists through the YMI programme was seen as a major benefit by many primary schools, as many teachers were not confident enough to lead music lessons themselves. In some cases, YMI class tutors had become 'embedded' within the culture and practice of schools. This had helped to raise the profile of the YMI programme and to broaden the range of activities on offer within schools.
- 4.8 At the same time, some respondents highlighted the opportunities that had been made available to 'upskill' teaching staff, including continuing professional development opportunities and 'hands on' support from visiting music specialists and YMI tutors. This is one of the priorities within the guidance from Creative Scotland on the use of the Formula Fund. Many said that this focus on continuing professional development had helped contribute towards the achievement of the P6 target in their areas. Some mentioned the Kodaly training programme and the NYCOS (National Youth Choir of Scotland) 'Going for Bronze' programme and how these programmes had helped develop practitioner skills, as well as encouraging more innovative approaches.
- 4.9 A few respondents said that having access to 'ring fenced' funding had been particularly helpful, both in terms of funding equipment and also music specialists.

Example: Kodaly Choral Project

The core of North Lanarkshire's P6 target is a Kodaly choral project. Pupils receive fortnightly choral tuition. Teachers are also expected to take part and this helps to 'upskill' them and enables them to deliver the activities themselves, leading to a more sustainable approach. Choral tuition has been delivered to around 4,000 primary school children. In addition, over 450 non-specialist teachers have been trained to take their skills into the classroom. This has helped to target a wider range of young people outwith the YMI funded allocation.

Informal Sector Fund

- 4.10 Many survey respondents felt that a key success of the YMI was simply being able to access funding, allowing them to develop and enhance the music making offer available to young people.

"Our project has run over a number of years. The sustained approach to the project has really made the difference, with a number of our participants going on to study music at various FE colleges and universities."

(Third Sector Organisation)

- 4.11 Many talked about the impact their work had on young people, rather than identifying particular successful approaches. Impact is covered in more detail in Chapter Five.

- 4.12 In terms of successful approaches, respondents highlighted the success of:

- **Collaborative approaches** – Successful approaches often involved building and strengthening partnerships between organisations, many times at local level or between local and national organisations.

"One of the main aims of the programme was to strengthen bonds between young musicians from Inverclyde and those living in Argyll and Bute. The Summer School has produced two new bands with members from different districts."

(Third Sector Organisation)

- **Mixed approaches** – Many found that for young people from different social and musical backgrounds, opportunities to collaborate musically worked very well. In some instances, this had fostered the development of new and exciting bands that would otherwise not have happened.
- **Flexibility** – A number of organisations highlighted the flexibility of the YMI, which allowed them to develop and shape their projects to suit local needs and the expectations of participants. Many felt that projects worked better when developed jointly with participants, and valued this local flexibility. This was particularly the case for some projects in remote rural and island communities.

- **Training and employment pathways** – Many organisations highlighted the success of training, volunteering, education and employment opportunities. Opportunities for young people helped them to progress into careers in the music industry and other fields. Opportunities for deliverers helped them to develop and expand their skills.

“The development of sound engineers who have progressed through to college and are still involved in the studio as well as a number of bands and musicians who have furthered their careers whilst still maintaining their association with ourselves.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- **Opportunities for all** – Many organisations highlighted the multitude of positive opportunities that had been created – particularly for those who would not normally have access to such opportunities. Organisations highlighted approaches to involving, for example, marginalised young people, young people with additional support needs or young offenders.

“Putting it out there that disabled people are performing and recording their own music, and raising awareness that it can be really, really brilliant.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

Example: North Edinburgh Arts

The North Edinburgh Arts project focuses on linking young people with each other, and with people who work in the industry and allowing them to take the time to share and record their own tracks in a really supportive environment. Having flexibility has meant that the project has worked better. Additionally through partnership work with Enable, the project has also been able to support two young people with additional support needs, with one of them going on to study sound engineering at college.

Example: Volunteering Opportunities in Glasgow

Glasgow Music Studios has a young volunteer system, where young people get the chance to volunteer to help on the project for experience. The other young participants relate better to the younger volunteers, as they provide positive role models for the participants. After the first year participants are invited back as volunteers. This provides a progressive ladder that young people can work up to – and gain experience both in music and employability skills.

Targeting disadvantaged groups

Formula Fund

- 4.13 Formula Fund leads were asked about approaches that had worked particularly well in breaking down barriers and helping to engage young people that would not normally take part in quality music making activities. Key themes to emerge were:

- taking time to find out what young people want;

- addressing practical issues like accessible venues, subsidised or free transport;
- providing free music making activities; and
- offering choice and variety of activities – so there is something for everyone.

“We need to choose music they will enjoy.”

(Formula Fund lead)

- 4.14 A small number of respondents said that getting the right music specialist to work with young people was often key to success. One respondent said that they had project where a professional musician ran guitar workshops with ‘disengaged’ young people. The musician had worked with lots of bands and was regarded by pupils as being ‘cool’. This had helped get the young people engaged and to focus and learn new music skills.

Example: The Rock College

The Rock College in Angus is run by local musician Steven Gibbins (member of Sonnet 65) and Polish Eurovision veteran, Mirek Hodun. In June 2010, the YMI team ran the first Angus Schools Rock Festival at a nightclub in Forfar. Kirriemuir band ‘Tonight We Let Go’ won, and their prize was studio time at a recording studio in Dundee.

Example: Impact Arts

Impact Arts worked with Barnardo’s Scotland’s prison youth services team, to engage with young people in Polmont Young Offenders Institution and Corton Vale Women’s Prison. It introduced a creative and highly participative music project in these institutions. It found that the social and emotional impact of engaging with music clearly shows a significant effect on participants’ social soft skills, communication ability, aspirations for the future and mental health.

- 4.15 Many respondents said that they were not sure about the overall impact that their activities were having on specific groups. On the other hand, a few respondents commented that they had had some real successes with activities that targeted harder to reach young people. In particular, one respondent said that they had received positive feedback from their schools, suggesting that young people were more engaged at school and were happier in themselves and were now more likely to go on and join other out of school activities and social programmes.

“It’s having the opportunities to learn an instrument which can lead to developments in confidence and self esteem.”

(Formula Fund lead)

Informal Sector Fund

- 4.16 Our survey of recipients of the Informal Sector Fund found that:

- 90 per cent had aimed to involve or support young people who otherwise would not participate in music; and

- 92 per cent had aimed to support the development of the youth music sector and workforce.

4.17 Generally, survey respondents felt that they positively involved young people who otherwise would not participate in music, with 87 per cent feeling they had done so very well. However, just two thirds (68%) felt that they had done very well in supporting the development of the youth music sector. Many gave examples of how they had engaged with young people with additional support needs or young people in disadvantaged areas.

Example: Engaging Deaf Young People

Feis Rois brought in a specialist musician who trains freelance musicians in working with deaf young people, so that they can deliver projects with the deaf school in Dingwall. And Composite Arts Association received £5,000 to enable young deaf people in Glasgow and West of Scotland to access music making opportunities, like group drumming and electronic music making.

Example: Engaging Young People with Additional Support Needs

Glasgow Music Studios received £30,000 to create regular 'music jam sessions' for groups of young people with additional support needs, or who were disengaged from education.

Example: Working in Disadvantaged Areas

Impact Arts received £40,000 to run a music project in Polmont. Young people were supported by professional musicians, working through the process of creating a music label and participating in a series of music making workshops.

Extent of partnership working

Formula Fund

- 4.18 Interviews with Formula Fund leads explored whether local authorities had worked with other organisations to deliver their YMI funded activity over the last four years. A significant number of respondents said that they worked in partnership with others to plan and deliver their YMI funded activities. Some of these said that they worked with colleagues within their local authority, for example, in social work, culture and leisure, health and wellbeing and schools.
- 4.19 Others said that they had developed a range of partnerships with national organisations in Scotland including:
- National Youth Choir of Scotland (NYCOS);
 - Royal Conservatoire of Scotland (RCOS);
 - Scottish Opera;
 - Scottish Youth Theatre;
 - BBC Scottish Symphony Orchestra;
 - Royal Scottish National Orchestra (RSNO);
 - Scottish Chamber Orchestra.

- 4.20 Some of these organisations had also received funding from the YMI, highlighting the connections made between funded organisations.
- 4.21 A number of Formula Fund leads also highlighted the variety of partnerships that they had developed with other specialist organisations to provide tailored approaches for children and young people, for example:
- **Drake Music Scotland** - providing music opportunities for children, young people and adults with disabilities;
 - **Feis Rois** – promoting Gaelic music and song culture; and
 - **Nordoff-Robbins** – providing music making opportunities for vulnerable children, young people and adults; and
 - **ABC Creative Music** – providing child centred music for early years, primary school and children and young people with additional support needs.

Example: Working with Children and Young People with Additional Support Needs

In Aberdeen the YMI programme supports an initiative that has been rolled out in additional support needs bases. This involves working with SKOOG Music, who teach children and young people to play an instrument called a SKOOG – a 9 inch electronic box that plugs into a computer. Through this, they have enabled many children and young people with additional support needs to learn to play music and some are now playing in concerts alongside bands. This approach has transformed the way that YMI work with children and young people with additional support needs.

Example: Working with Young People in Care

In Aberdeenshire, the YMI team works with Millennium Child and Direct Music who run programmes like sound engineering for young people in care, or young vulnerable people. They work closely with Social Work and Community Learning and Development, as well as schools including additional support needs schools.

- 4.22 In addition to formal partnerships, many Formula Fund leads said that they worked in collaboration with a number of local bands and orchestras that promoted both traditional and classical music, for example the local fiddle group, pipe band or jazz orchestra. A smaller number of respondents said that they either worked exclusively with freelance music specialists to deliver activities or their activities were delivered by in-house music specialists funded directly from the YMI budget.

“90% of the programme is delivered by freelance professionals in their field. The programme is alive – the evaluations we get back from young people show that they are motivated and they reference where the tuition came from.”
(Formula Fund lead)

- 4.23 Formula Fund leads highlighted a number of benefits of working in partnership, including:
- providing access to a range of musical experts and specialists;

- widening and enhancing the range of opportunities available;
- improved planning and delivery of activities;
- broadening coverage to include more schools; and
- helping to 'upskill' teachers and meet the P6 target.

"Working with partners brings a different perspective and expertise. It enables partners to share resources."

(Formula Fund lead)

- 4.24 However, a few Formula Fund leads commented that in recent years they had to scale back their partnership activities, due to cost increases and static budgets. A few said that YMI funding was now being prioritised to cover in-house staff costs.

"Partnership working for me has now ceased. We can't afford it anymore; they are not increasing money with inflation."

(Formula Fund lead)

- 4.25 Most Formula Fund leads also highlighted that they worked jointly with teachers and specialists in schools. Often the main focus of their interaction with teachers was through training and continuing professional development activities. Some highlighted the importance of programmes like Kodaly and 'Going for Bronze' in helping to give teachers the skills and confidence to lead music sessions in class – and ensuring that the YMI programme could be sustained in the longer term.

"Kodaly is most successful where teachers get involved and keep it up after the Kodaly project is finished."

(Formula Fund lead)

Informal Sector Fund

- 4.26 We asked recipients of Informal Sector Funds about the extent of partnership working involved in their YMI activity. Just under two thirds of survey respondents said that they worked with other organisations to deliver or plan YMI funded activities. Most of these said that they worked with a range of different partners and organisations, sometimes at both local and national level, including:

- local authorities – e.g. Schools, Social Work and Regeneration;
- local community and youth groups;
- local businesses;
- professional musicians and music industry specialists;
- local and national voluntary organisations;
- universities, colleges and locally based music academies;
- Scottish Prison Service;
- Police Scotland; and
- BBC Children in Need.

“We partnered up with Glasgow-based record label Chemikal Underground who provided support, mentoring, and ran studio excursions for us which allowed participants to experience a professional recording studio.”
(Third Sector Organisation)

4.27 Respondents said that their partners provided support in a number of ways, including:

- delivering taster sessions and music sessions;
- providing mentoring support, advice and technical support;
- helping with the planning, organisation and delivery of events and activities;
- supporting the design and distribution of publicity material; and
- assisting with the identification, recruitment and referral of projects participants.

4.28 Respondents identified a number of positive benefits that had resulted from partnership working. It had:

- helped them to recruit new participants and extend the reach of their project to target those most in need;
- provided additional prestige and credibility – helping to raise the profile of projects and attract more participants;
- brought together a wide range of experience, knowledge and support - helping to provide a high quality learning experience for young people;
- provided inspirational experiences for young people – through being able to work with professional musicians and other industry experts;
- helped to ensure that projects were tailored to the individual needs of young people - as a result of close collaboration with referral organisations;
- improved signposting between services and organisations; and
- encouraged a more joined up approach to the planning and delivery of activities.

“It was a HUGE influence! (x) is an extremely talented drummer and musician and also is fantastic working with young people.”
(Third Sector Organisation)

“These partnerships formed some of the most successful and inspiring sessions that we did throughout our whole project.”
(Third Sector Organisation)

4.29 While almost all organisations highly valued their partnership working, two respondents said that partnership working was cumbersome and slowed things down, as there were sometimes conflicts between different organisational aims and objectives.

Example: Tinderbox Project

Through working in partnership, Tinderbox has been able to engage a larger and more diverse numbers of participants and audiences. As a result, young people from diverse backgrounds and different groups are able to work together and build relationships. This has helped Tinderbox to create a larger and more ambitious project. In addition, they have learned a lot from other partners and been able to share working styles and ideas.

Example: Community Partnerships

Community partnerships play a key role in Firefly's outreach and community development programmes. The capacity for local youth workers and volunteers to work alongside skilled music specialists generates a great deal of exchange, learning and enhanced appreciation of the role of the arts in building a healthy and pro-active community.

Challenges and lessons learned**Formula Fund**

4.30 Formula Fund leads were also asked about the main challenges that they faced in meeting the P6 target and how they had addressed these.

4.31 One challenge was interpreting the P6 target. Two respondents said that it was sometimes difficult to interpret what Creative Scotland's expectations were of the P6 target. Some said that this could change from year to year. Three respondents said that the target was too 'prescriptive' and 'inflexible' in terms of age, and as a result did not cater for the needs of P7 children.

"There is a huge investment in P3, 4 and 5 and this barrier (beyond P6) when we have to charge for tuition."

(Formula Fund lead)

4.32 Many respondents, particularly those in island and rural authorities, said that geography presented a number of practical challenges, including:

- high transport costs and associated travel time;
- increased resources required to cover large geographic areas;
- limited access to specialists in remote areas; and
- lack of economies of scale in small, dispersed rural schools.

"There is a lack of people on the island that can go into school, or who want to go into schools."

(Formula Fund lead)

"The challenges of meeting the P6 target relate to geography of the area and the scattered nature of our community."

(Formula Fund lead)

- 4.33 Some Formula Fund leads also highlighted the fact that it was sometimes difficult to get buy-in from head teachers and senior management teams to support the delivery of the YMI programme in some schools. Others said that it was sometimes difficult getting schools to deliver what they said they would, due to capacity or motivation issues. This meant that the continuity between YMI funded activity and further supporting activity within the classroom provided by teachers could be lost. A few respondents pointed to the shortage of qualified and experienced tutors and said that more needed to be done to 'upskill' non-specialist teaching staff, so that they were able to lead music sessions in class.
- 4.34 A few respondents said that they would welcome the opportunity to meet with other YMI leads from across Scotland to share ideas, creative approaches and good practice. It was suggested that Creative Scotland could help to support this by organising events and promoting networking opportunities.

"It would be useful to get together to share ideas and thoughts."
(Formula Fund lead)

Informal Sector Fund

- 4.35 Recipients of the Informal Sector Fund were asked about what they might do differently, if undertaking a similar project again. Just over four fifths of respondents chose to answer this question. About a third of these said that they were happy with the way things were and didn't see the need to change their current approaches. But many of these highlighted that they were open to learning, changing and adapting on an ongoing basis. Others made suggestions as to how they might do things differently in the future, including:
- applying for more funding – accompanied by widening publicity and marketing to attract more participants;
 - extending project timescales to provide more in depth experiences for participants;
 - undertaking more research at grant application stage – being clearer about what exists locally;
 - developing more innovative ways of involving young people, particularly those that are 'harder to reach';
 - providing funded transport for young people;
 - placing more emphasis on developing confidence and social aspects of projects;
 - encouraging greater collaboration with other organisations to maximise impact; and
 - finding ways to support young musicians and songwriters beyond funded projects.

Summary

- 4.36 YMI funding recipients highlighted a number of key successes, including:
- a focus on early years and early intervention;
 - a flexible approach, with freedom to tailor to local circumstances;
 - access to music specialists, providing expertise and supporting teachers to develop their skills;
 - joint working, building links between organisations;
 - bringing together young people from different social and musical backgrounds;
 - links with training and employment pathways; and
 - opportunities for all – including marginalised young people, young offenders and people with additional support needs.
- 4.37 Being able to offer a choice of free music making activities was central to breaking down barriers to access as well as taking time to find out what young people want.
- 4.38 Most Formula Fund and Informal Sector Fund recipients had worked in partnership with others to plan and deliver their YMI funded activities. Some had developed partnerships with national organisations whereas others had built partnerships locally. Partnerships were particularly useful when providing tailored approaches for young people with additional support needs, or in specific musical cultures (such as Gaelic). Many felt that partnership work was one of the most exciting aspects of their approach to delivering YMI funded activity, bringing about real benefits for young people and deliverers.
- 4.39 Funded organisations were also asked about the main challenges they faced. One of the main challenges for Formula Fund leads was interpreting the P6 target. Some felt that it was hard to know what it meant and that expectations changed regularly. Both Formula Fund leads and Informal Sector Fund recipients would welcome more opportunities to share ideas and good practice.

5. Impact and Outcomes

Introduction

- 5.1 This chapter explores the difference that the YMI has made, across a wide range of areas. This includes exploring the impact on young people directly involved in the activities, on the wider community, for funded organisations; and for the youth music sector as a whole. It is based on:
- analysis of End of Project Forms for funded projects;
 - interviews with Formula Fund leads in 31 of the 33 areas; and
 - nine interviews and 70 survey responses from organisations funded through the Informal Sector Fund.
- 5.2 It is therefore important to note that this chapter is strongly based on the views of funded organisations – not participants in YMI funded activity. The more detailed evaluation of 2014/15 will focus strongly on gathering views from children and young people.

Impact on young people

Formula Fund

- 5.3 This evaluation explored the impact of Formula Fund supported activity on young people through evaluation of End of Project Forms and discussions with Formula Fund leads.
- 5.4 The End of Project Forms provide a wealth of data about the outcomes of YMI funded activity, and the impact it has had. Analysis of these Forms highlights that the YMI is contributing to a wide range of outcomes for young people, including:
- **Musical opportunities** – The YMI is providing young people with more opportunities through:
 - an increased number of musical opportunities;
 - a more diverse range of opportunities;
 - higher quality music provision;
 - improved access in rural areas; and
 - more opportunities to perform live.
 - **Musical skills** – YMI activities are developing musical skills in participants, including understanding of rhythm and pitch and fluency of music reading. It is introducing young people to new instruments and developing their playing skills. Often this is building a lifelong interest in music, with young people getting involved in local choirs, bands and orchestras, going on to sit exams or continue with tuition, and to consider careers in the music industry. It is also developing wider creative skills.

- **Personal skills** – The YMI is building social and personal skills, including confidence, self esteem, friendship, social skills, communication, teamwork, decision making, listening, attention spans, responsibility, timekeeping, respect, discipline and attendance. For young people with additional support needs, it is felt that there are particular benefits in terms of focusing attention. And for young people with behavioural issues, it is providing a route through which young people can be engaged in learning. In some areas, the use of music to support transition from nursery to primary school is resulting in positive benefits for children.
- **Equality and inclusion** – The YMI is involving young people who may not otherwise participate in music. It was commonly mentioned that young people with additional support needs have seen a significant improvement in the music making opportunities available to them. Young people with additional support needs can have the chance to participate in mainstream music making opportunities and performances, which can contribute to inclusion and equality. Many felt that the YMI was helping to bridge the gap between additional support needs and mainstream education.

Example: Diversity of Opportunities

Highland Council runs a project jointly with Fèisean nan Gàidheal which provides an introduction to a variety of aspects of traditional music. It aims to put music into historical and geographical contexts and focuses on traditional music including tin whistle, traditional song and Gaelic song.

Example: Equality and Inclusion

City of Edinburgh Council runs a project called 'The Inclusive Classroom' working in all eight schools for children with additional support needs in the city. The project is delivered in partnership with Drake Music Scotland, and involves a series of bespoke workshops for all children at additional support needs schools. The workshops introduce new technology instruments including Skoog, Soundbeam and Figurenotes. Staff at schools receive associated continuing professional development to build sustainability of the project.

- 5.5 Overall, young people are being supported to realise their musical ambition and to get involved at a level that suits them.
- 5.6 In depth discussions with Formula Fund leads highlight a strong belief that the YMI has been central to delivering improved outcomes for young people. Formula Fund leads emphasised the impacts listed above, as well as highlighting general improvements in pupil attainment in other curriculum areas, particularly in numeracy, literacy, and language skills, better discipline and improved behaviour.

"It has given them an opportunity to be involved, when they maybe wouldn't have chosen to be involved."

(Formula Fund lead)

“It gives them the chance to try different things and to challenge their perceptions.”

(Formula Fund lead)

- 5.7 Many commented on the wider skills that young people had developed as a result of participating in the YMI programme. One respondent said that secondary schools in his area had noticed that young people who had participated in the YMI programme were operating at a higher level than those who hadn't been involved.

“They have more developed music skills, more confidence, and the standards have been raised.”

(Formula Fund lead)

- 5.8 However, many said that it was very difficult to measure impact on young people in practice, as it was hard to build a robust evidence base. Much of the feedback that was gathered was anecdotal, and Formula Fund leads found it was hard to capture evidence particularly around 'soft' outcomes.

“It has made a huge difference – immeasurable.”

(Formula Fund lead)

Informal Sector Fund

- 5.9 Recipients of the YMI Informal Sector Fund also believe that YMI activities are resulting in positive outcomes for young people. Funding recipients identified similar outcomes as for the Formula Fund, in relation to musical opportunities, musical skills, personal skills, and equality and inclusion.

“It has involved the children of Shetland from birth up to school age in music making activities therefore bridging the gap and building a firm structure of music education right through from birth to adulthood.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- 5.10 In particular, recipients of the Informal Sector Fund feel that the YMI is:

- **Developing leadership and empowerment** – YMI funded activity is encouraging youth ownership of the local youth music sector – for example through encouraging young people to volunteer and become involved in committees and organisation of youth music activities. Many felt that it was fostering a *“do it yourself”* attitude among young people – encouraging a proactive approach to individual, group and community music making.
- **Increasing aspirations for disadvantaged young people** – YMI activity is encouraging positive attitudes and behaviour and increasing aspirations, particularly for young people who face disadvantage and exclusion. It is encouraging them to access further training and education, and supporting young people in vulnerable situations – such as in hospital or in prison – to develop a positive attitude and make

positive choices in their lives. It is also resulting in positive outcomes for young people with additional support needs, including improvements in following instruction, coordination skills, movement and dexterity.

*“Confidence, confidence, confidence, - we've found that music is a hugely successful hook to attract young people with self esteem/confidence issues.”
(Third Sector Organisation)*

- **Inspiring young people to learn more** – Giving young people access to new musical experiences - whether attending national performances, providing opportunities to work with professional musicians, or accessing mentoring support from industry experts - has helped to broaden their understanding of the music process and also their own potential, with many going on to study music at further education institutes.
- **Reaching vulnerable young people** – Music is proving to be a successful route through which young people who may not normally engage can be encouraged to participate in learning and community activity. This can include young offenders, young people with additional support needs, pre-school children and their parents, and young people living in disadvantaged areas. It is also bringing young people with different experiences and backgrounds together in an inclusive environment, and enhancing bonding between parents and children.

“It has enabled them to broaden their horizons, literally and metaphorically, through opportunities to travel and work with professional musicians, and this experience of success has changed their mindset about what is possible in their own lives.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- **Supporting transitions** – In a small number of situations, music is being used as a way of easing the transition between nursery and primary, and primary and secondary school, through YMI funded activity.
- **Supporting music careers** – Young musicians and bands are being supported to produce demos, recordings and live performances. This is supporting careers in music and stimulating interest in music related careers.

“It launched young people's careers and gave a lot of self-belief to those that had very little.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- **Building happiness** – A number of funding recipients felt that a key outcome was that young people were happier as a result of participation in the YMI and that it was important this was captured as a key outcome.

“It has allowed young people to learn, create, collaborate and express their talent, as well as a massive increase of confidence and happiness.”
(Third Sector Organisation)

Example: Wider Benefits of Music Making

The Sound Festival project in Aberdeen has exposed young people from the regeneration areas of Aberdeen to the world of music making and production. Young people are able to meet and work with tutors and project staff who work professionally in the industry in Scotland. They also learn about how there are many different ways in which music and music-related practitioners can be ‘successful’ and earn a living from the industry.

Example: Working in Disadvantaged Areas

Sistema Scotland received funding through the YMI to engage with all primary two children in Raploch and Govanhill. Pupils took part in an inclusive, immersive and intensive programme of music making, titled ‘Big Noise’. Opportunities took place after school and during school holidays, focusing on participation in the orchestra. In Raploch, Big Noise also engaged with older children in primary four and five.

Example: Supporting Music Careers

Scottish Music Centre’s Hit the Road programme takes young independent music makers and those interested in working in the industry on their first live music tours across Scotland. It targets young people aged 14 to 19, providing workshops on industry topics run by high profile professionals and supporting young people to learn first-hand about the music industry.

- 5.11 A number of recipients of Informal Sector Funding emphasised that providing access to professional musicians, industry experts, engineers and technicians, not only enabled young people to develop their musical potential, but also helped them to improve their employability skills, with some going on to pursue careers in the wider music industry. In addition, a few respondents said that some young people who had participated in their projects had gone on to study music at either higher or further education institutions.

Example: New Career Prospects

Thick Skinned Productions in Edinburgh has helped musicians and sound engineers to develop their craft and to progress their musical careers to the next level. There have also been a number of students who have progressed through to recording courses at the Edinburgh College and Napier University.

“We have testimonials from participants stating they had been 'blown away' by the experience, with outcomes far exceeding expectations, and that they had been greatly encouraged and motivated to continue to pursue music as a viable career.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

Impact on funded organisations

Formula Fund

5.12 It is clear that the YMI Formula Fund is having an impact on local authorities, particularly education and schools.

- **Curriculum for Excellence** – The YMI is helping to integrate music across the curriculum. It is strengthening music as a medium for learning about a wide range of topics. It is also enhancing the cultural life of schools and communities. Many local authorities highlighted that the methods used through YMI would be used in future to explore other topics and subjects, meaning the approach is sustainable and becoming mainstreamed within teaching practice.
- **Teacher skills** – The YMI is providing a wide range of continuing professional development options for teachers. This is resulting in increased confidence of teachers using music in class, resulting in it being used more often. This is also contributing to the sustainability and reach of YMI approaches, with teachers playing a key role in delivery. New partnerships created by the YMI are helping to transfer new skills to the classroom.
- **Building resources** – The YMI is resulting in the creation of a bank of music resources and skilled staff, which many feel will enable a sustainable approach to music in the future.
- **Promoting inclusive approaches** – The YMI is ensuring wider music provision across primary, secondary and additional support needs schools, and promoting joint working between pupils with additional support needs and others.
- **Recognition with the local authority** – The YMI is stimulating interest in and discussion about the potential of music and the benefits of music education, within local authorities. Many reported an increased recognition of and support for music within the local authority, and across individual schools, with a clearer understanding of how music links with local priorities. Some also felt that the YMI was enhancing the reputation of local authorities as providers of music services.

“For Education, it has helped to raise the profile and also given the department opportunities to think about supportive partnerships.”

(Formula Fund lead)

Example: Building the Skills of Teachers

In one area, 336 non-specialist primary school teachers attended training delivered by a Kodaly specialist, allowing for sustainability of music projects beyond YMI funding. In another area, Drake Music delivered opportunities to 22 music specialists, which enables continuation of inclusive music-making classes beyond the YMI funded activity.

Example: Delivering the Curriculum for Excellence

The Curriculum for Excellence seeks to integrate experiences and outcomes for pupils across the whole of the school. In one area, a choral citizenship project allowed music to be used as a route for exploring citizenship. This provided a good teaching template promoting interdisciplinary teaching which will be utilised in other schools within the local authority.

Informal Sector Fund

5.13 Analysis of both End of Project Forms and survey responses highlights that the Informal Sector Fund is helping funded organisations through:

- **Building community presence** – YMI funded activity is raising awareness of the organisation within local communities, providing positive publicity, increasing participation and membership rates, and building lasting relationships with young musicians. Many organisations felt that they had gained wider recognition within their communities as a result of participating in YMI funded projects.

“The YMI funded project has raised the profile of the Mendelssohn on Mull Trust on the island, with more families becoming engaged in our music making activities than ever before.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- **Supporting new approaches** – A number of recipients said that project had given them the confidence to try new models and approaches. End of Project Forms highlighted that sometimes YMI funded activity is providing the evidence that approaches can be successful, enabling organisations to seek long term funding from other sources.

“Trying out new models and having the confidence to work differently compared to our approach to working in other areas of the UK.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- **Building partnerships** – Some said that the project had helped them to develop new partnerships with other organisations involved in music. Others said that it had improved networking opportunities across professionals and organisations at local, national and even international level. For example, the YMI funded activity enabled sharing of resources; building signposting routes for young people; sharing contacts and networks; and providing links to training, education and employment. National organisations found that YMI activity enabled them to share skills at a local level, and embed these within local communities;

“It has helped us build contacts with youth music projects around the world, which has then facilitated international youth music projects.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- **Building staff skills and experience** – Some said that as a result of working with young people, their staff had gained new skills and experience. In particular, a number of recipients highlighted the continuing professional development opportunities offered through the YMI programme, as well as the wide range of apprenticeships and traineeships that had been created as a result of YMI project funding.

“The YMI has helped to highlight the importance of quality CPD for staff involved in delivery and management of youth music programmes.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- **Improved planning and viability** – Some recipients said that they were more focused and were able to plan better as a result of the funding support they received from YMI. Some said that they were developing year round programmes, whilst others said that they were more able to develop and deliver longer term projects. Many said that the funding from YMI had improved their overall viability by removing financial risk and uncertainty. In some cases, this had helped to extend the reach of some projects, whilst in others it had helped to create new employment and training opportunities.

“Our organisation employs musicians with disabilities and/or learning difficulties, to deliver inclusive Music Training projects across Central Scotland. These opportunities would not have been possible with the support of YMI.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

“It has allowed us to grow and to develop the projects that we offer. It has also given us some stability of funding.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

Impact on the youth music sector

Formula Fund

5.14 There is a strong belief that the Formula Fund is supporting the development of a thriving youth music culture. Local authorities report that the YMI is resulting in:

- increased uptake of instrumental instruction;
- increased overall participation in the youth music sector;
- formation of new bands, orchestras and choirs;
- more involvement in extra-curricular activities;
- enhanced links between schools and the youth music sector; and
- increases in the number of young people participating in bands, orchestras and choirs – at both local and national level.

Example: New Bands, Orchestras and Choirs

Some local authority areas have seen the creation of new youth bands, orchestras and choirs – including school groups and regional groups. Many have seen an increase in participation in national bands, orchestras and choirs too.

“Through extra curricular activities and progression pathways, the youth music sector had been enhanced.”

(Formula Fund lead)

- 5.15 One respondent, however, was concerned that there were limited links between school based and community based musical activity.
- 5.16 Formula Fund leads also highlighted a number of benefits for deliverers, including:
- opportunities to develop their delivery skills and confidence through working with children and young people;
 - access to secure employment opportunities and a stable income, enabling them to survive better as professional musicians;
 - availability of mentoring support and CPD training;
 - increased networking opportunities with other local deliverers and partners;
 - more flexible working – opportunities to try new approaches and more creative ways of working.

“For some it has provided a career, for others it is giving them teaching experience.”

(Formula Fund lead)

Example: Multiple Benefits to Deliverers

In Stirling, the Formula Fund lead felt that the YMI programme had enabled local deliverers to gain other work; to develop their confidence as educators and to see young people they have been working with over the years, grow and develop into blossoming musicians across different music genres. It had also helped them to consider their lecturing approaches at colleges they work in; to get involved in new music commissions with young people they teach and to create new audiences.

Informal Sector Fund

- 5.17 Recipients of the Informal Sector Fund noted the contribution the YMI makes to raising awareness of music and culture. Many said that in more remote and rural communities, it had created new opportunities to bring young people together to participate in traditional music making. In addition, a small number of respondents said that their projects were helping to generate exposure to different musical cultures and that this has been beneficial on both a musical and cultural level.

Example: Music Making Opportunities in the Western Isles

The Ceolas Uibhsit project has constructively supported music making at secondary school level within an isolated rural area and has enabled different groups of young people to engage together as a band.

Example: The BIG Project

The CPD funding which has been built into the projects has enabled staff, volunteers and trainee music tutors to gain skills and experience to help them to be confident members of the youth music sector. The BIG project's work with professionals in the music industry has also given many musicians and songwriters the opportunity to learn skills relevant to the youth work sector.

- 5.18 Many said that YMI had provided a platform to promote and showcase youth music in Scotland. Some respondents felt that it was helping to develop a talent pool of young musicians and that this in turn was supporting the development of lively music scene – enabling young people to form bands and to perform at local events and festivals.

“The creation of four new bands and year-long provision of support for an additional six to eight others.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- 5.19 Some recipients emphasised said that their projects had encouraged better partnership working at both the local and national level.

“It has offered a new, contemporary and collaborative approach to an orchestra and brought together different genres and people with varied backgrounds and experiences into this process.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- 5.20 Some also added that as a result of improved networking, young people were more aware of music making opportunities, where to access help, professional expertise and support.

Impact on the wider community

- 5.21 Evidence from both the Formula Fund and Informal Sector Fund highlights that the YMI is helping to link schools with communities at local and national level. Overall, the YMI is having a positive impact on the wider community through:

- **Community links** – The increase in performances is helping to link schools with communities. It helps communities to appreciate the talents of their young people, and contributes to community cohesion.
- **Community relations** – YMI funded activity has helped to challenge perceptions of disadvantaged young people; build connections between young and old members of the community; and challenge attitudes towards people with Additional Support Needs.
- **Community safety** – Through involving young people in diversionary activities related to music, there is evidence of reduced anti-social

behaviour and a perception of safer streets in some areas – particularly clear through the Informal Sector Fund.

- **Building volunteering** – YMI funded activity has encouraged volunteering not just among young people, but also parents and the wider community.
- **Recognition of music** – The YMI is increasing the profile of music in schools, and building wider recognition of music among parents and the wider school community.

Summary

5.22 Organisations in receipt of YMI funding feel that it has had a significant impact on young people and the youth music sector. It has also had some impact on funded organisations, deliverers and the wider community.

5.23 The YMI has enabled young people to access musical opportunities, contributing to:

- enhancing the musical and personal skills of young people;
- promoting equality and inclusion;
- inspiring learning and enhancing pupil attainment and performance;
- enhancing discipline and behaviour at schools;
- developing leadership and empowerment;
- supporting music related careers;
- increasing aspirations for disadvantaged young people; and
- building happiness and enjoyment for young people.

5.24 It has also impacted on local authorities, particularly education and schools, through supporting the delivery of the Curriculum for Excellence. The YMI is strengthening music as a medium for learning about a wide range of topics, and enhancing the cultural life of schools and communities. It is building the skills of teachers; promoting inclusive approaches; and building the resources available to schools. It is also more broadly stimulating an interest in and discussion about the potential of music, within local authorities.

5.25 For third sector organisations, funding has helped these organisations to build a presence within local communities, and has supported new approaches to music making. It has also built staff and expertise, and helped build partnerships across the youth music sector.

5.26 Deliverers involved in YMI funded activity have had opportunities to develop their skills and confidence, and access to high quality support, networking and continuing professional development training.

5.27 The YMI has supported the youth music sector more widely, through stimulating more interest in music making – resulting in increased uptake of tuition and participation in bands, orchestras and choirs at local and national level. New ensembles have been established, and there are enhanced links between schools and the youth music sector. It has also contributed to raising

awareness of music and culture, and provided a platform to promote and showcase youth music in Scotland.

- 5.28 The YMI is also having an impact on wider communities, through helping to build relations, promote community safety, change perceptions of young people, promote volunteering and increase recognition of the value of music.
- 5.29 Some of the outcomes the YMI is contributing towards are very much intended, and built in from the outset of projects. However, others are positive unintended consequences of the YMI funding – including impacts around community relations, perceptions of young people, community safety and promoting and supporting careers in music.
- 5.30 A summary of the outcomes the YMI is contributing towards is provided in the table below. It is important to note that this is a summary of the high level outcomes the YMI contributes towards – and that each individual project or activity will not contribute towards every outcome.

Table 5.1: Summary of outcomes the YMI is contributing to				
Young people have more opportunities to take part in a diverse range of quality music making opportunities	Young people develop their musical skills	Increased participation in local and national bands, orchestras and choirs	Young people study music and gain qualifications and employment in music related fields	Young people have a lifelong interest in music
	Young people develop their personal and social skills	School attainment and attendance increases		
	Young people are more confident	Young people volunteer and get involved in their community	Young people access high quality training and education in their preferred field	Young people have increased awareness of music and culture across the world
	Young people have strong decision making and leadership skills	Young people are empowered to make choices in their lives		Young people are happy
	Vulnerable young people understand their opportunities and choices	Vulnerable young people increase their aspirations	Young people talk about and resolve wider issues and barriers in their lives	Inequalities in access to music are reduced
	Disadvantaged young people have opportunities to participate in music making alongside others	Disadvantaged young people receive support to access the same music making opportunities as others	Equality and inclusion is an underlying principle in YMI activity	
There are more opportunities to access support and training in delivering youth music activities	Deliverers build their music related skills	Music is integrated across the school curriculum	There are strong links between schools and the youth music sector	There is a sustainable approach to music delivery in schools
	The pool of deliverers increases		Local authorities, parents and communities recognise the value of music	
	There are more resources to support music (both in and out of school)			
Organisations can try out new and innovative approaches to youth music	Organisations have stronger partnerships and networks	New bands, orchestras and choirs are formed at local and national level	Youth music organisations are stronger and better resourced	There is a thriving youth music culture in Scotland
	Skills and experience within the youth music sector increase	Youth music organisations have a stronger community presence at local level		
	Organisations improve their planning and viability	Increased awareness of music making opportunities for young people		

6. Future Outcomes Measurement

Introduction

- 6.1 This chapter explores how the outcomes of the YMI could be effectively measured and evaluated in the future. It draws on the views of Formula Fund leads and funded third sector organisations. It also suggests considerations to be taken into account when developing a new outcomes measurement framework for the future.

Views on YMI administration processes

Completing the monitoring forms

- 6.2 Overall, 88 per cent of Informal Sector Fund recipients who completed our online survey felt that it was very or quite easy to complete the monitoring information required. Others (12%) found it quite or very difficult.
- 6.3 However, there were questions about whether the monitoring information was useful. Some felt that the information was not used or analysed – with some describing the process as “a bit tick box”. Others asked whether the numbers were relevant, suggesting that measurement of outcomes was much more important. Many felt that this needed to be measured in softer ways – through case studies, photos, footage and soundbites.

“The piece I feel is missing is information that proves a real difference was made during YMI funded projects.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

- 6.4 A number of Informal Sector Fund recipients also felt that the requirement to evaluate immediately on completion of the YMI funded activity restricted their ability to measure outcomes and impact. Some felt that Creative Scotland should encourage the use of longitudinal case studies of young people, as this would help to assess the longer term impact of the YMI programme.

“The evaluation should not stop when the project finishes. I am still gathering information from the participants which I keep note of and send to Creative Scotland from time to time. Years down the line things are still happening which are a direct result of the initial project.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

“It is always good to know how many kids we actually engage with. It would be interesting to know, because we work with teachers and have this wonderful idea that they go back to school enthusiastic about it, but do they really roll it out? Do the kids really benefit in the way we think they do?”

(Third sector organisation)

- 6.5 Many Formula Fund leads commented that making the annual monitoring returns to Creative Scotland was not difficult, but it could sometimes be time

consuming. Some said that it was a 'necessary evil', recognising that YMI projects needed to be accountable.

"Once a year, it's one of those tasks which is quite annoying, but once you get started it doesn't take long."

(Formula Fund lead)

"It is easy to compile, but is onerous and takes hours and days of my time."

(Formula Fund lead)

6.6 In contrast, six Formula Fund leads felt that the process was too inflexible and that Creative Scotland's 'one size fits all' approach did not reflect the challenges faced in some local authority areas, particularly in island and rural areas

6.7 In addition, Formula Fund recipients echoed the concerns of Informal Sector Fund recipients that there was too much focus on gathering numbers and statistics, and it was not clear what Creative Scotland used this information for. Seven said that the annual return did not really capture any meaningful information on the overall impact of the YMI programme. A few respondents suggested that Creative Scotland should be more 'hands on' and do more visits to see what was being delivered and use this to promote examples of good practice.

"There is a lot about numbers and activities and not a lot about impact."

(Formula Fund lead)

"It (Creative Scotland) doesn't capture the incredible success some of the young people have had."

(Formula Fund lead)

Continuity of funding

6.8 A number of Formula Fund leads said that it had been difficult to plan effectively because of the short-term nature of annual funding allocations. Some suggested that if funding was allocated on a three-year basis, this would allow them to undertake better forward planning, increase delivery and also ensure that links were made to other their council's plans and priorities. This was echoed by recipients of the Informal Sector Fund.

"I wish I had known there would be 10 years of funding, instead of every year just panicking that the money will run out, or that I haven't spent enough."

(Formula Fund lead)

"It's hard to plan ahead when you don't know if the funding is available."

(Formula Fund lead)

Changing requirements

6.9 A few Formula Fund leads and Informal Sector Fund recipients commented on Creative Scotland's role in relation to programme management. Some said that there had been a lot of changes in terms of staff in the early years of

Creative Scotland, which had led to inconsistencies in approaches in certain areas, for example, assessment teams. It was acknowledged by some that this had settled down in recent years and relationships with Creative Scotland staff had improved significantly. A few respondents suggested that it would be beneficial if Creative Scotland staff were able to come out and visit some of the YMI projects.

- 6.10 Others called for less bureaucracy and greater flexibility, particularly in relation to the ability to review and adapt programmes in-year, and also in relation to the carry forward of underspend from one financial year to the next. Many also felt that the need to evaluate activity before receiving new funding was a challenge. A minority highlighted that the requirement to submit monitoring forms before receiving the final tranche of funding, or applying for new funding, caused them some financial difficulty.

“The timelines are difficult and the goalposts move.”

(Third Sector Organisation)

A new monitoring system

Important indicators

- 6.11 We asked Formula Fund leads and Informal Sector Fund recipients for ideas about the important measures and indicators to be included in a new monitoring framework. While many felt that it was important to focus on outcomes, there were few ideas about the most useful indicators that could be used to demonstrate these. Many suggested qualitative methods of gathering information – such as blogs, photos, diaries, DVDs, press articles, performance recordings and testimonials – but did not suggest the indicators that these should demonstrate.
- 6.12 A small number of respondents highlighted outcomes based indicators – including measuring confidence, self esteem, musical ability and progression to study in music related fields. However, most focused on process related outputs, including:
- number of young people participating in activities;
 - profile of participants – including age, gender, ethnic origin and disability;
 - what was delivered and the quality of this;
 - number of group/ school performances; and
 - cost of activity per participant.
- 6.13 When discussing information gathering, a number of respondents highlighted that it would be useful to collect and gather examples of good practice that could be collated and then shared across the Youth Music sector nationally. Some also suggested that a simple database of what YMI funded activity is happening and where would be very helpful, so that applicants don't duplicate other projects and enable better signposting.

Links with other systems

- 6.14 Formula Fund leads and Informal Sector Fund recipients were also asked about additional information that they collected that did not necessarily get sent to Creative Scotland. It was clear that respondents gathered a wide range of 'softer' more qualitative information, including feedback from young people, parents and wider stakeholders; photos; footage; diaries; and blogs. A third of the Informal Sector Fund recipients gathered additional information in this way – both through formal and more informal routes.

"We also have non-verbal participants and we are trying different ways to get their feedback."

(Third Sector Organisation)

- 6.15 Organisations said that it was good to have qualitative information, as it enabled them to get a better feel for how the projects had impacted on young people, parents, teachers and tutors. Some Formula Fund leads said that this type of information was also useful in helping to demonstrate how YMI was impacting on their council's wider outcomes and priorities.
- 6.16 Views were split on whether respondents felt it would be helpful to link the YMI monitoring framework to other monitoring and evaluation frameworks. A number of Formula Fund leads felt that it might be too ambitious to try to link the YMI monitoring framework with corporate systems across 32 local authorities, as these systems were likely to be different. However, a small number of respondents said that they were already able to link with other corporate systems, for example the 'How Good is our Culture and Sport' monitoring system. Some others thought that this would be a good idea, as it would help to raise awareness of the impact of the YMI programme on a range of council priorities and outcomes, and improve their ability to track positive destinations of pupils. As an alternative, one respondent suggested that it might be more meaningful to link to the priorities and outcomes for Curriculum for Excellence at a national level.

Draft monitoring framework

- 6.17 Feedback from funding recipients, and our experience of analysing the YMI data that is available provides a clear steer for future monitoring. By and large, current participants were relaxed about the current monitoring and evaluation system – but felt that it was not focused on outcomes. In addition, returns were completed inconsistently between organisations and there was no overall quality control of the data produced.
- 6.18 The monitoring framework should be based on a number of principles:
- **It should be outcomes focused** – To support the monitoring and evaluation framework, it would be helpful for Creative Scotland to develop a logic model for the Youth Music Initiative (YMI). Chapter Five of this report includes a possible model based on those delivering YMI and their monitoring and evaluation reports. If desirable, this could be linked to wider strategic outcomes – such as Creative Scotland

ambitions, Scottish Government national outcomes and Curriculum for Excellence.

- **It should be proportionate** – It would be unreasonable to ask every deliverer to report annually on all these outcomes – but it would certainly be possible for all monitoring and evaluation questions to be designed to help provide information that is relevant to the logic model.
- **It should be clear** – A new monitoring system should build in greater consistency in approach to completion – recognising that this is across a range of disparate organisations. This could be assisted by clearer guidance on the information required and how this might be gathered to improve consistency across Scotland.
- **It should be timely** – Creative Scotland should consider its approach to deadlines for submitting monitoring information. The current timescales mean that monitoring and evaluation is often rushed, and can't capture longer term outcomes. It may be appropriate to encourage a short annual return for projects funded for more than one year, and a more detailed end of project form for when these complete – allowing organisations to break down activities and outcomes over more than one year.
- **It should allow for learning** – The monitoring framework should include opportunities for organisations to reflect on what didn't work well, as well as what did.

6.19 Overall, there is a need improve the understanding of the impact of the programme while not making unreasonable demands of those receiving grants. This could be done by focusing on a smaller number of key outcomes and measures. It may also be appropriate to set aside a small proportion of the total grant to support and develop monitoring and evaluation by projects. As an example, the CashBack for Communities programme asks projects to set aside up to five per cent of their total grant for monitoring and evaluation activities.

6.20 Our initial thoughts are that the following information should be gathered and reported by each project.

Numbers

6.21 At present it is hard to identify the distinct number of young people who have been involved in YMI funded activity. We suggest in future using three (relatively) simple pieces of information:

- **The number of young people involved** – This should be the best estimate of the number of distinct young people involved during the project. The current counting of attendance days is, we believe, confusing and has been interpreted differently across projects. We are also not convinced of the value of gathering the number of performances; exhibitions; workshops and so on. If there is a need to get an indication of the intensity of the involvement of young people, you could ask projects to estimate the depth of engagement as low, medium or high – and provide broad definitions for these terms.
- **The number of jobs created** – This could be split between temporary and permanent with a full time equivalent figure (based on a 35 hour

week) provided. There is a need to check that this is fully understood, as the numbers available on this area to date are inconsistent.

- **The number of volunteers** – This would be the number of distinct volunteers involved.

Profile of the young people involved

6.22 This is important given the aim of the programme to reach the young people who are least likely to take part in music making. We suggest that information about a small number of groups which are most likely to benefit from YMI is gathered. For example:

- **An estimate of the percentage of the total number of young people who come from deprived areas** – this would be based on the SIMD datazones, using the lowest 15% of datazones from the most recent SIMD.
- **The percentage of young people with additional support needs**
- **The percentage of young people who do not identify as White Scottish or White British** – this could usefully be compared to number of minority ethnic young people within the target population.

Outcomes

6.23 At present, there is a great deal of information contained in the End of Project Monitoring Reports about the long-term benefits of the project. But because the question is open ended, the information can be rather 'scatter gun' and hard to compare across the programme.

6.24 We suggest that for those projects who will receive a one year grant they should be asked to provide quantitative or qualitative evidence of progress against the following outcomes. Clearly, it is not expected that every project would have evidence of progress against every one of the outcomes. In addition, they could indicate any other outcomes (not on the list) on which they had impacted.

Young people:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Young people develop their musical skills. • Young people develop their personal and social skills. • Young people are more confident. • Young people have strong decision making and leadership skills. • Vulnerable young people understand their opportunities and choices • Disadvantaged young people have opportunities to participate in music making alongside others.
Deliverers:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Deliverers build their music related skills. • The pool of deliverers is increased. • There are more resources to support music (both in and out of school).
Organisations:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organisations have stronger partnerships and networks. • Skills and experience within the youth music sector increase. • Organisations improve their planning and viability.

- 6.25 Those organisations receiving funding of more than one year should be asked to respond on the intermediate (and in some cases the longer term outcomes) as well as the shorter term outcomes.
- 6.26 Any new monitoring framework will need to be introduced gradually over time, and effectively piloted.

7. Issues for Consideration

Introduction

- 7.1 This chapter summarises important issues for consideration in the future development of the Youth Music Initiative. This chapter is based on all of the findings from the retrospective evaluation.

Impact of the Youth Music Initiative

- 7.2 The Youth Music Initiative has clearly helped to reduce some of the gaps identified in the 'What's Going On?' report of 2003, which led to the creation of the YMI. It has supported opportunities to access singing, music technology and creative music making opportunities. And it has supported the informal sector to develop and consolidate the music making opportunities it can offer.
- 7.3 The YMI is also clearly engaging some of those who would otherwise not normally participate in music making. In particular, it is engaging young people in areas of social and economic deprivation; in areas where music opportunities may be limited; in early years of life; and with additional support needs. However, there is not so much evidence of activity to provide opportunities for young people from minority ethnic communities and young people who are looked after by their local authority.
- 7.4 While there is clear evidence that the YMI has helped to create access to music making opportunities, the evidence about how it has supported the development of the youth music sector is less clear. There are some examples of work which is making an obvious contribution to the youth music sector, but overall, funding recipients are not quite so confident that this work has had a significant impact. In a small number of cases, work has not gone ahead as planned in this area.
- 7.5 For many of the young people involved, the YMI is having a positive impact. Anecdotal evidence tells us that this impact can be transformational and life changing, contributing greatly to overall health and wellbeing and supporting pathways onto training, education and employment. However, the information currently available does not tell us much about the scale of these impacts, and how many young people are likely to be affected.

Interpreting the P6 target

- 7.6 The vast majority of the YMI budget goes towards supporting the P6 target.

"Every school pupil in Scotland should be offered a year of free music tuition by the time they reach primary six".

- 7.7 However, in some cases there is some confusion about the interpretation of the P6 target. Some local authorities are interpreting this as tuition over a

single year. Others are interpreting it as provision from early years through to primary six. Some are unclear why primary sevens are not included in the target.

- 7.8 There is a need to be very clear and consistent about what we mean by the P6 target, and why. This will help to ensure that local authorities understand the purpose of the funding, and can use it to its greatest effect.
- 7.9 There is also evidence that while most local authorities appear to be using the YMI funding in a positive and successful way, a very small minority feel that their approach is more 'ad hoc'. Creative Scotland may need to work to identify examples of approaches which add value and contribute clearly to outcomes, and share this learning across the network. There may be a need for targeted support in developing new approaches, in a small number of areas.

Links and outcomes

- 7.10 The YMI makes a clear contribution to Creative Scotland's objectives, and the Scottish Government's national outcomes. It also supports the delivery of the Curriculum for Excellence, and the experiences and outcomes within this.
- 7.11 Awareness of the potential links between YMI funded activity and wider local authority objectives is building in some areas. However, there is a need for more work to recognise the contribution of the YMI. Links to community planning are weak in most cases, and need to be developed further. YMI leads may require support to make these connections.

Consistency of funding

- 7.12 Approximately a third of recipients of the Informal Sector Fund received more than one funding award over the past four years. Some received more than one award within the same year.
- 7.13 It is worth considering an approach to funding which:
- allows some organisations to take a long term approach – for example with funding over a three year period (subject to monitoring and evaluation); and
 - allows some organisations to be funded on a project basis.
- 7.14 Offering a longer term funding award could help to consolidate successful approaches; strengthen skills and networks; and allow for more effective monitoring and evaluation.
- 7.15 Creative Scotland should also consider whether innovation and change should be an important component when assessing applications. If a project can demonstrate great success, this could be a good reason for continuing to fund it – so that new young people can benefit from it each year.

- 7.16 It is also important to think carefully about the transparency of decision making around managed funds. It must be very clear how these awards are contributing to programme outcomes.

Monitoring and sharing experiences

- 7.17 There is a clear need to consider how levels of participation and outcomes of YMI funded activity are measured. We suggest that there is a move away from gathering numbers on the types of activity, moving towards building a greater understanding of who is taking part, and what difference this is making – for them, for the wider community, and for the youth music sector. There is a need to try to capture the real impact of the YMI in a creative and inspiring way.
- 7.18 It is worth noting that work to strengthen and change monitoring systems does take time. It requires significant commitment from both funders and funded organisations, and therefore needs clear ownership and understanding of the importance of undertaking monitoring and evaluation.
- 7.19 Finally, there is a clear desire for more links, networking and sharing good practice between YMI funded organisations.

Appendix One: YMI Formula Fund Leads: Discussion Guide

About Your Youth Music Initiative Funding

1. How long have you been the lead for the YMI funding in your local authority area?
2. Were you involved in the YMI before that – in another area or another role?
3. What part of your Council deals with the funding and management of YMI?

Aims and Outcomes

4. Can you describe the process of how you decide as a local authority the priorities for use of YMI funding? Has this changed over time?
5. Do you think that the aims of YMI funded activity in your area have changed over the past four years? Why was this?
6. How have the priorities and outcomes of your authority's YMI funded activity over the past four years related to:
 - The Curriculum for Excellence?
 - The Single Outcome Agreement?
 - Wider community planning aims?

The P6 Target

7. Over your time of involvement in the YMI, what has worked particularly well in working towards the P6 target of offering every school pupil a year of free music tuition by the time they reach primary six?
8. What have the main challenges been around working towards this target?

Delivery and partnership

9. Have you worked in partnership with other organisations to deliver or plan the YMI funded activity, over the past four years? What difference has this joint working made to how the YMI activities develop, and what impact they have?
10. Have you consulted with young people, colleagues across the authority and external stakeholders when planning your YMI programme? What difference has this made?
11. Have you worked with class teachers and specialist staff in schools? What difference has this work made in sustaining music activities?

Impact

12. Over the past four years, what difference do you think the YMI funded activity has made for:
 - young people;
 - the local authority;
 - YMI activity deliverers; and
 - the youth music sector?

13. Through your YMI funded activity over the past four years, have you explicitly aimed to involve young people who otherwise would not normally take part in quality music making activities?
14. What has worked particularly well in breaking down barriers to participation and engaging each of these groups?
15. What difference do you think your YMI funded activity has made for each of these groups?

Monitoring

16. How do you feel about the monitoring information the YMI currently requires? What is easy/ difficult to provide? What would make it easier?
17. What do you think are the most meaningful indicators of your YMI activity and its impact locally?
18. Do you gather any additional information on YMI funded activities that you don't send to Creative Scotland as part of its monitoring system? Why is this, and what more does it tell you?
19. Would it help if a future YMI monitoring framework linked to the other monitoring and evaluation systems you use? Which ones?

Lessons Learned

20. Overall, which aspects of your YMI activity have worked particularly well and why?
21. Is there anything you would do differently if you were doing this type of work again?
22. Any other comments?

Appendix Two: YMI Informal Fund, Third Sector Organisations: Survey

About Your Youth Music Initiative Funding

1. What is the name of your organisation?
2. Which local authority area(s) does your organisation operate in?
Multiple choice options – All 32 local authorities (tick all that apply) or national
3. When did your organisation first get involved in the YMI?
Multiple choice options – 2003 to 2014

Aims

4. Over the past four years, do you think there has been a good fit between the aims of your organisation and the aims of YMI funding?
Yes/ No
- 4b. Please tell us a bit about why you answered in this way:
5. In your YMI funded activity, did your organisation explicitly aim to:

Aims	Yes	No
Involve or support young people who otherwise would not participate in music?		
Support the development of the youth music sector and workforce, for the benefit of young people?		

If no, go to Q6

- 5b. If so, to what extent do you think your organisation's YMI funded activity has achieved these aims?

	Very well	A little	Not at all
Involving or supporting young people who otherwise would not participate in music?			
Supporting the development of the youth music sector and workforce?			

Impact

6. Thinking about the YMI funded activity your organisation has delivered, how would you rate the positive impact that it has had on:

	A lot	A little	None
Young people			
Your organisation and its staff			
The youth music sector			

7. What are the main differences you think it has made to:

Young people	
Your organisation and staff delivering the project	
The youth music sector	

8. Overall, which aspects of your YMI activity have worked particularly well and why?

9. Is there anything you would do differently if you were doing this type of work again?

Delivering YMI Funded Activity

- 10a. Did you work in partnership with other organisations to deliver or plan the YMI funded activity?

Yes/ No (If no, go to Q10)

- 10b. If so, please tell us a bit about this:

- 11c. How did this partnership influence how your YMI activity developed and the impact it had?

Monitoring

12a. How easy was it to provide the monitoring and evaluation information the YMI required on completion of your funding period?

Very easy/ quite easy/ quite difficult/ very difficult

12b. If it was difficult, please tell us what would have made it easier?

13a. Do you gather any additional information on YMI funded activities that you don't send to Creative Scotland as part of its monitoring system?

Yes/ No

13b. If yes, please tell us what additional information you hold:

14a. Does your organisation use any other monitoring and evaluation frameworks to record your activities and impacts?

Yes/ No

14b. If yes, which frameworks do you use?

15a. Do you have any views on what information should be gathered from YMI funding recipients, and collated at a national level?

Yes/ No

15b. If yes, please tell us what information you think should be gathered:

Thank you for your time.